

Symbolic Violence in Indonesian Society: Does Islamic Radicalisation Lead to Religious Intolerance?

Irfan L. Sarhindi

University College London, United Kingdom

Abstract

Islam is by far the largest religion in Indonesia, and given the size of Indonesia's population and the massive percentage of which follow identify as Muslim, Indonesia becomes the biggest Muslim majority country. In the light of this reality, Islam becomes the society's dominant role of conduct. As to be predicted in such system, a social hierarchy has developed in which Indonesian Muslims enjoy the most privileges. Such a situation has created a fertile ground for the possible use of what Pierre Bourdieu's call 'symbolic violence'. As a consequence, there is a tendency for the minor group of Indonesian people to be marginalized. Sadly, this seems to be exacerbated by the rise of Islamic conservatism and radicalisation in post-1998 Indonesia. That says, their lack of capability in recognizing minority's rights often leads to religious intolerance. Considerably, as to solve such a situation, widening perspective as well as strengthening inter-group and inter-religion dialogue is required.

Keywords: *Violence, Islam, Radicalism and Society*

I. INTRODUCTION

It can be argued that Islam, as a set of system, has played an instrumental role in uniting the diverse and multi-cultural Indonesian people. Subsequently, as being proved by the role of '*resolusi jihad*' (Jihad resolution), declared by the biggest Islamic organization in Indonesia, Nahdlatul Ulama (the Awakening of Ulama—NU), Islam has managed to help the struggle for independence.¹ Islam has become, and is still, a stabilizing force for the unity of Indonesia. It has been, and is still, situated as a 'shared language'.² Meaning, many of Islamic terms and words became so popular and used in everyday communication broadly. This helps people to develop an understanding regardless of their diverse cultural and racial background. Other than this, the fact that Islam is converted by more than 85% of Indonesian people, it is accepted normal to have Islamic values set as society's role of conduct although Indonesia's law is not based on sharia. Islam, therefore, dominates the society's norms, rules, and principles. Pierre Bourdieu, the French sociologist, claims that such a situation could create what he calls as 'symbolic violence'.³ It can be seen by how such a domination could establish a privilege for the majority and marginalization for the minority. The situation appears to be worse

¹ Zainul Milal Bizawie, *Masterpiece Islam Nusantara: Sanad dan Jejaring Ulama-Santri (1830-1945)* (Tangerang: Pustaka Compass, 2016). See also Didin Nurul Rosidin, "PESANTREN AND MODERNITY IN INDONESIA: MA'HAD ALY OF KUNINGAN" (2012) 9:2 HUNAJA Stud Islam 219.

² Pelin Ayan Musil, "Democracy and Islam in Indonesia," edited by Mirjam Künkler and Alfred Stepan" (2016) 23:6 Democratization 1092 at 1.

³ Raquel Recuero, "Social Media and Symbolic Violence" (2015) 1:1 Soc Media Soc 2056305115580332. See also Jo Watson & Jacqueline Widin, "Maintaining the status quo: symbolic violence in higher education" (2015) 34:3 High Educ Res Dev 658.

since Indonesia's Islam is witnessing the rise of Islamic conservatism and radicalisation.⁴ Their closed-mindedness and judgmental attitude appear to make them easier to provoke violence to those who are different from them—whether they are Muslims or not. The questions arise: does this illustrate the setback of religious tolerance? How could this relate to Pierre Bourdieu's idea of 'symbolic violence'?

To answer such question, I will divide this essay into four subsections. First, I would portray the picture of Indonesian Muslims as to contest whether or not their domination in terms of numbers lead to socio-cultural and political hegemony. In so doing, symbolic violence is the thing I would articulate. Second, I would examine the rising of the conservatives and how this might shape the face of Indonesian Islam. Follows from this is the articulation of Islamic radicalisation and how this, along with the conservatives, might challenge religious tolerance. Lastly, I would trace the key causes of the situation as to offer alternatives that can be taken, either for counterbalance or prevention.

II. SYMBOLIC VIOLENCE AND THE PORTRAYAL OF INDONESIAN SOCIETY

Pierre Bourdieu is a celebrated French sociologist. He is known for his three concepts on explaining the social phenomenon: 'habitus', 'capital', and 'field'. Bourdieu believes that "practice results from relations between one's dispositions (habitus) and one's position in a field (capital), within the current state of play of that social arena (field)."⁵ 'Habitus' is taken from the word 'habit' and is perceived to be shaped and structured by individual's background context, upbringing, and education, but is also capable of shaping individual's character and future.⁶ Individual's background context, upbringing, and education, however, is not a value-free. They are shaped and influenced by what Bourdieu perceives as 'capital'. He classifies capital into four categories, ranging from economic into symbolic.⁷ The interaction between 'habitus' and 'capital' happens at a social space called 'field'.⁸

In defining this social space called 'field', Bourdieu does not limit his conception to a physical realm of space. He uses a football field as an analogy. For him, a football field is not merely a square field, surrounded by supporters within a stadium. Rather, it is something that is composed of rules and boundaries to which players have to obey. Football as a game contains many symbols as its instrument of constructing the 'reality' of the game. The similar situation works for a larger context of society. In short, Bourdieu perceives that social reality is constructed. In the process of constructing the reality, each is driven by her or his own interest. The objective is to secure privilege. Given a society is consist of rather a diverse type of people regarding their culture, race, religion, et cetera, and that the number of one group could be (far) larger than the others, there is a tendency of domination to exist. When the dominant group creates a role of conduct that only serves for its interest, then this would create suffering for the minor group.⁹

⁴ Martin et al van Bruinessen, *Contemporary Developments in Indonesian Islam: Explaining the "Conservative Turn"*, Martin van Bruinessen, ed. (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak, 2013).

⁵ Michael Grenfell, *Pierre Bourdieu: Key Concepts* (Acumen, 2012).

⁶ Karl Maton, "Habitus" in *Pierre Bourdieu Key Concepts* (Durham, 2008).

⁷ Grenfell, *supra* note 5.

⁸ Patricia Thomson, "Field" in *Pierre Bourdieu Key Concepts* (Durham, 2008).

⁹ Pierre Bourdieu, "Symbolic Power" (1979) 4 Crit Anthropol 77 at 80.

Such a situation, according to Bourdieu, proves the existence of what he calls 'symbolic violence'. Symbolic violence could be manifested as physical abuse, but it is more than that. On 'symbolic violence', the majority (or the dominant group) just need to live their daily lives and let the rules prioritize its privilege.¹⁰ On that, it can be argued that this group has a huge power since it can influence and shape the role of conduct of the society. Schubert, when identifying the indicator of symbolic violence, acknowledges four impacts. First is a social hierarchy; second is inequality; third is a taken-for-granted privilege enjoyed by the dominant group; four is the lack of recognition for the dominated.¹¹ The latest one is often followed by what Webbers call as 'the domestication of the domesticated'.¹²

In the case of Indonesia, it has been largely known that Indonesia is a diverse country, not only regarding religion, but also in terms of culture, language, and race. However, despite this, Indonesian Muslims share the biggest percentage of the population. The number is even higher than the number of other-religions' members combined. Indonesian Muslims, accordingly, can steer the role of conduct of Indonesian society in the interest of fulfilling their needs. In so doing, Indonesian Muslims have a possibility in prioritizing their privileges while on the same time marginalizing the minority. In short, Indonesian Muslims, given their power and number of members, could—whether consciously or not—establish a symbolic violence. Therefore, to contest about whether it is the case, I shall trace how far the situation produces privilege, inequality, social hierarchy, and the lack of recognition for the minority. In so doing, my concern would be on Indonesia's religious diversity.

As to begin with, I may say that in Indonesia, religion is important.¹³ Not only this is compulsory by Constitution, but it is often used as a moral indication. Therefore, in Indonesia, being atheist could mean a citizenship abolition or be seen as less virtuous.¹⁴ Lyn Parker, a Professor of University of Western Australia who has some research on educational issues in Indonesia, states that "The Constitution of 1945 guarantees religious freedom but not the freedom not to be religious."¹⁵ Indonesia acknowledges six official religions and has around 245 beliefs¹⁶. In Indonesia, an individual need to declare her or his religion in her or his citizen card even though religion is a private concern.¹⁷ As far as religiosity is the concern, it seems that such a situation is the result of, firstly, the emphasis on 'belief in God' in Indonesia's ideology, namely Pancasila (Five Principles).¹⁸ Secondly, the insistence of 'being religious' is one of the goals of

¹⁰ Schubert, "Suffering/Symbolic Violence" in Michael Grenfell, ed, *Pierre Bourdieu Key Concepts* (Durham: Acumen Publishing Limited, 2008).

¹¹ Grenfell, *supra* note 5.

¹² *Ibid.*

¹³ Riaz Hassan, "On Being Religious: Patterns of Religious Commitment in Muslim Societies" (2007) 97 *Muslim World* 437.

¹⁴ See S Osman, "Is Atheism Illegal in Indonesia?", (2012), online: *Jkt Globe* <<http://jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/archive/is-atheism-illegal-in-indonesia/>>.

¹⁵ Lyn Parker, "Teaching Religious Tolerance", *Indones* (4 October 2010).

¹⁶ Warsa Tarsono, "Tokoh Penganut Kepercayaan: 'Sudah Matipun Kami Masih Didiskriminasi'", (2015), online: *Madina* <<http://www.madinaonline.id/sosok/wawancara/tokoh-penghayat-kepercayaan-sudah-matipun-kami-masih-didiskriminasi/>>.. Nevertheless, Indonesians are permitted to convert to a religion outside the six Human Rights Watch, *Atas Nama Agama: Pelanggaran terhadap Minoritas Agama di Indonesia* (New York: Human Rights Watch, 2013).

¹⁷ Phelim Kine, "Indonesia's growing religious intolerance", *openDemocracy* (25 November 2014), online: <<http://www.opendemocracy.net/openglobalrights/phelim-kine/indonesia%E2%80%99s-growing-religious-intolerance>>.

¹⁸ Aside of 'Belief in God', Pancasila is also composed by humanism, unity, democracy, and social justice.

schooling.¹⁹ Thirdly, students have their weekly religious lesson in schools. Fourthly, there is a growing interest of religiosity since the 1980s.²⁰

Islam, by chance, becomes the most converted religion in Indonesia. Uniquely, Islam is not set as the country's ideology.²¹ However, this is not necessarily mean that the needs of Indonesian Muslims are not well accommodated. For example, to mark the end of Islamic holy month known as Ramadhan, Muslims celebrate what is called 'Eid al-Fitr' by breaking their fast, gathering on the mosque, and visiting families and friend to ask for forgiveness. This situation is accommodated through the modification of the regulation, legitimized by the government, normalized and accepted by Indonesian society. The results are as follows. Indonesian Muslims enjoy a shorter working time during Ramadhan. Restaurants and food stalls are forced to close during daylight in the name of respect. THR (*Tunjangan Hari Raya*—incentive that is given due to the coming of Eid al-Fitr), as well as a week-or-two holiday, are given in view of Eid al-Fitr celebration. These are the privilege Indonesian Muslims enjoy and somehow are taken-for-granted. It can be argued that such a privilege cannot be enjoyed by Muslims in a Muslim minority country.

In the educational system, the domination of Islamic norms, values, and principles can also be found. As I have said earlier, students are managed to learn the religion subject once a week. Given that not all students are Muslims, ideally speaking, schools need to accommodate a specific religion lesson for each student based on her or his religion, taught by a teacher of her or his faith. Indonesia's Law 20/2003 encourages schools to do so.²² However, as Parker found, this is rarely the case. As my experience as well, it seems that Islam turns to be the default religion subject. For non-Muslim students, they are pleased to miss the session and learn their religious textbook by themselves. Rarely schools facilitate these minor groups with teachers of their faiths. Aside from this, it can be expected that the value set up in daily life at school is Islam.²³ Nailufar articulates Quran recitation at a classroom at the beginning of the day as an example.²⁴ I would articulate another one. Every Monday morning students have to attend a weekly ceremony. Such a ceremony is closed by someone praying. The content is commonly Islamic, indicated by the use of Islamic terms and prayer, despite the fact that not all students are Muslims and the schools themselves are not Islamic schools but general public schools instead. This, by large, represents inequality and the lack of recognition for the minority.

Thus, if the examination is taken as far as it reaches the education policy, it can be found that Quran is the only scriptural sources cited in the National Curriculum as to

¹⁹ Lyn Parker, "Religious environmental education? The new school curriculum in Indonesia" (2016) *Environ Educ Res* 1; Che Noraini Hashim & Hasan Langgulung, "Islamic Religious Curriculum in Muslim Countries: The Experiences of Indonesia and Malaysia" (2008) 30:1 *Bull Educ Res* 1; Imas Kurniasih & Berlin Sani, *Implementasi Kurikulum 2013 Konsep dan Penerapan* (Jakarta, 2014); Departemen Agama, *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional* (2003).

²⁰ Azyumardi Azra, "The Rise of Muslim Elite Schools: a New Pattern of 'Santrization' In Indonesia" (1999) 64: XII *Al-Jamiah* 63; see also Minako Sakai & Amelia Fauzia, "Islamic orientations in contemporary Indonesia: Islamism on the rise?" (2014) 15:1 *Asian Ethn* 41.

²¹ Parker, *supra* note 15; Martin Van Bruinessen, "Postscript: the Survival of Liberal and Progressive Muslim Thought in Indonesia" in Martin van Bruinessen, ed, *Contemp Dev Indones Islam Explain Conserv Turn* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013).

²² Parker, *supra* note 15.

²³ see Nibras Nada Nailufar, "Guru yang Intoleran Membahayakan Siswa (Intolerant Teachers endanger Students)", *Kompas.com* (25 May 2016).

²⁴ *Ibid.*

justify education goal.²⁵ Moreover, under the Ministry of Religious Affairs, it can be found that each religion is maintained by the specific department. However, for Islam, there are two additional departments which are responsible for specific tasks: Islamic education and Pilgrimage.²⁶ Indeed, such a situation is reasonable given that the proportion of Muslims in Indonesia, given the proportion of Islamic educational institutions and the number of pilgrims each year. However, such privilege still has the capability of maintaining the domination of Islamic values, norms, and principles. When comes to pop culture as the alternative form of learning, Islam is the only religion which preaching shows can be found in all TV stations. It even outnumbers the others combined. The number gets even higher in the coming of Ramadhan. Many commercial TV shows shape their performance to be, said, more Islamic. On the other hand, there is only few TV stations have other-religions' preaching show.

With such privilege and domination, it seems that there is a social hierarchy where Muslims belong at the highest class. It is uncontested and is perceived as normal. Given social hierarchy could secure privileges for the powerful group and the marginalization for the powerless group, it can be argued that there is a tendency of symbolic violence occurs. Harms could be done whether consciously or unconsciously; whether as physical abuse or as domestication. In the context of religious life in Indonesia, violence could be a manifestation of intolerance. Commission for Missing Persons and Victims of Violence (*Komisi Untuk Orang Hilang dan Korban Tindak Kekerasan—KontraS*), for instance, claims that religious intolerance is the second most mentioned cause of human right abuses.²⁷ That says religious intolerance is more than just suitable as the indicator of symbolic violence. Nevertheless, it needs to be reminded that what is covered by the term 'religious intolerance' here is the intolerance among diverse groups of Indonesian Muslims and between various religion members in Indonesia. Later on, I will use the word 'inter-group' as to describe the former and 'inter-religion' as to portray the latter.

1. Is Indonesian Islam No Longer with the 'Smiling Face'?

In the first subchapter I have described how symbolic violence seems inevitable and therefore the task remained is to eradicate the harm caused. As far as religious tolerance is the concern, In Indonesia's context, its maintenance can be traced back to the time of Majapahit Kingdom. It was a celebrated scholar, namely Mpu Tantular, who issued a slogan called Bhineka Tunggal Ika (unity in diversity).²⁸ The very idea was to reconcile Hindu and Buddhist members among the society. When the idea of a nation-state that covers thousands of islands that used to be the territory of Majapahit was declared and went to the name of 'Indonesia', Bhineka Tunggal Ika was situated as its very principle. This slogan gains more functions than it used to be given its embracement of numerous tribes, culture, the local language, and religions. With this slogan, Indonesia believes in setting its diversity as an enriching pillar of the nation rather than a barrier.

The slogan, along with Pancasila, is cultivated in schools. It is clear that besides producing religious students, the goal of the educational curriculum is also to create the

²⁵ Parker, *supra* note 19.

²⁶ see Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, "Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Kementerian Agama RI", (2016), online: *Dir. Jenderal Pendidik Islam Menteri Agama RI* <<http://pendis.kemenag.go.id/>>.

²⁷ see Phelim Kine, "Indonesia's Growing Religious Intolerance", *Open Democr* (26 November 2014).

²⁸ Memory of Majapahit, "Bhineka Tunggal Ika", (2007), online: *Mem Majapahit* <<http://www.eastjava.com/books/majapahit/html/bhinneka.html>>.

nationalist ones.²⁹ Indonesia's educational system has citizenship education which constitutes the doctrine of Pancasila and moral values such as respect, friendship, nationalism, solidarity, and so on. However, it seems that the taught is rather superficial. I might state so since the discussion of SARA (*Suku, Agama, Ras, Antar Golongan*— Tribes, Religions, Race, and Inter-groups) is regarded taboo. This is to say, Indonesian people are asked to respect, and live within, diversity, but have to avoid a deepening intercultural dialogue.³⁰ They have to realize that they are different but are less likely encouraged to understand about how, and to what extent, they can consolidate and discuss their distinctions. During the reign of New Order Regime (led by Soeharto from 1966 to 1998), tolerance among diverse communities is built upon fear rather than a deep inter-group and inter-religion understanding. This became the case since the regime took a military approach in maintaining political stability. With the prohibition of SARA's discussion, the only approach taken to prevent social friction was by threatening people with punishment; from imprisoning to murder. Therefore, the fall of the regime was followed by various inter-cultural conflicts such as of Moluccas' civil war between Muslim and Christian for the absence of threatening government is not bridged by intercultural understanding.

However, the prohibition of SARA's discussion is not the only factor to blame. The fall of New Order Regime was also followed by the rise of what Martin van Bruinessen, a celebrated researcher on Indonesia's Islam, calls 'the conservative turn' and radical Islam.³¹ For a very long time, Indonesian Muslims are considered moderate. With this characteristic, Indonesia's Islam is then known as Islam 'with the smiling face'. Cooperative and adaptive with local culture and context, Indonesia's Islam has proven to be capable of maintaining social harmony; compatible with nationalism, modernity, democracy, and pluralism.³² Indonesia's Islam is also perceived to be capable of becoming a role model to the Middle East Islam³³ even though it is suspected as less Islam, specifically by Salafi Wahabi movement which is considered radical.³⁴ However, the moderate face of Indonesian Islam does not fall into one single expression. Rather, it is diverse. Despite the classification made by Clifford Geertz³⁵ and the traditional dichotomy of traditionalist-modernist³⁶, for Bruinessen, moderate Indonesian Muslims

²⁹ Kurniasih & Sani, *supra* note 19.

³⁰ see Parker, *supra* note 15.

³¹ "Overview of Muslim Organizations, Associations and Movements in Indonesia" in Martin van Bruinessen, ed, *Contemp Dev Indones Islam Explain Conserv Turn* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013) 21.

³² Sukron Kamil, *Islam dan Demokrasi: Telaah Konseptual dan Historis* (Jakarta: Gaya Media Pratama, 2002); Victor J Sensenig, *Indonesia, Islam, and Democracy: Dynamics in a Global Context* (2008); Mahmud Hamdi Zaquq, *Islam Dihujat Islam Menjawab: Tanggapan atas Tuduhan dan Kesalahpahaman* (Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2008); Hamka Haq, *Islam: Rahmah untuk Bangsa* (Jakarta: RMBOOKS, 2009).

³³ E Giora, "The Indonesian Model", *Jerus Post* (7 April 2014).

³⁴ Mona Abaza, "Asia Imagined by the Arabs" in Kamaruzzaman Bustamam-Ahmad & P Jory, eds, *Islam Stud Islam Educ Contemp Southeast Asia* (Kuala Lumpur: Yayasan Ilmuwan, 2011) 1; Azra, *supra* note 20. Azra, however, also perceives that the misconception of Indonesia's Islam as less pure Islam is caused by Geertz's classification of Indonesian Muslims. In arguing so, Azra criticizes the idea of *abangan* (nominal) Muslims.

³⁵ For Geertz, Indonesian Muslims can be of *santris* (pious Muslims), *abangan* (nominal Muslims), and *priyayis* (aristocrat Muslims). See Geertz, "The Javanese Kijaji: The Changing Role of a Cultural Broker" (1960) 2:2 Soc Comp Stud Soc Hist 228.

³⁶ see Azyumardi Azra, *The transmission of Islamic reformism to Indonesia: Networks of Middle Eastern and Malay-Indonesian "Ulama" in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries* 1992 [unpublished]; Azyumardi Azra, "Jaringan Ulama Nusantara" in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 169; Nurdinah Muhammad, "Karakteristik Jaringan Ulama Nusantara Menurut Pemikiran Azyumardi Azra" (2012) 14:128 J Subst V Ol 1 4 No 1 April 201 2 73; Ahmad Najib Burhani, "Lakum dīnukum wa-liya dīnī: the Muhammadiyah's stance

can be of progressive, liberal, and conservative. Unlike the progressives and liberals who are contextual in interpreting Islamic thinking, the conservatives tend to be more textual. This makes the conservatives have commonality with the radicals. The distinction remains in their approach to violence by using the name of God. While radicals are violent, conservatives are less violent.

However, to reify how far ‘the conservative turn’ takes a stance in influencing the smiling face of Indonesian Muslims, it needs to be addressed, first and foremost, Bruinessen account on this issue. Frankly speaking, for him, Indonesia’s Islam is a battleground between progressive-liberal intellectuals versus authoritative conservatives. When he mentions progressive-liberal intellectuals, he highlights two prominent Muslim scholars of that stream, namely Abdurrahman Wahid (Gusdur) and Nurcholish Madjid (Cak Nur). While the former has been responsible for the modernization of NU and is a key figure in the establishment of post-traditionalist Muslims³⁷, the latter was responsible for the establishment of *Jaringan Islam Liberal* (Liberal Islam Network—JIL).³⁸ Both of them campaign the contextualization of Islamic thinking in the interest of *maslahah al-ummah*—the goodness of the society. Gusdur articulates the idea of *Pribumisasi Islam* which underlines the necessity of the acculturation between Islamic thinking and local culture.³⁹ This idea gives an important understanding of cultural Islam as well as becomes the embryo of Islam Nusantara’s discourse.⁴⁰ Aiming at identifying the moderate identity of Indonesia’s cultural Islam, Islam Nusantara is fit to be situated as a de-radicalisation campaign. Cak Nur himself strongly criticizes Islamic party and continues to oppose the idea of a caliphate.⁴¹ With his organization and his activity in Paramadina University, Cak Nur spreads the necessity of interpreting Islam in today’s situation and context. However, even though the effort of progressive and liberal Muslims is to contextualize Islamic thinking as to make it works with today situation, their thinking appear to be situated as dangerous

towards interfaith relations” (2011) 22:3 *Islam Christ Relat* 329; Howard M Federspiel, “The Muhammadiyah: A Study of an Orthodox Islamic Movement in Indonesia” (1970) 10 *Indonesia* 57; Florian Pohl, “The Muhammadiyah: a Muslim Modernist Organization in Contemporary Indonesia” in Michael D Palmer & Stanley M Burgess, eds, *Wiley-Blackwell Companion Relig Soc Justice* (Sussex: John Wiley & Sons, 2012) 243., there is another classification argued by Bruinessen *supra* note 4.

³⁷ Ahmad Baso, *NU Studies: Pergolakan Pemikiran antara Fundamentalisme Islam dan Fundamentalisme Neo-Liberal* (Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga, 2006).

³⁸ Muhamad Ali, “The Rise of the Liberal Islam Network (JIL) in Contemporary Indonesia” (2005) 22:1 *Am J Islam Soc Sci* 1; Ahmad Ali Nurdin, “Islam and State: a Study of the Liberal Islamic Network in Indonesia, 1999-2004” (2005) 7:2 *N Z J Asian Stud* 20.

³⁹ See Abdurrahman Wahid, “Pribumisasi Islam” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 33.

⁴⁰ Azra, *supra* note 36; Zainul Milal Bizawie, “Islam Nusantara sebagai Subjek dalam Islamic Studies: Lintas Diskursus dan Metodologis (Islam Nusantara as a Subject in Islamic Studies: Inter-Discourses and Methodologies)” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 239; Bizawie, *supra* note 1; Alifuddin Muhadjir, “Islam Nusantara untuk Peradaban Indonesia dan Dunia” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016); Yahya C Staquf, “Islam Merangkul Nusantara” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 191; Tim Penulis JNM, *Gerakan Kultural Islam Nusantara* (Yogyakarta: Jamaah Nahdliyin Mataram and Panitia Muktamar NU ke-33, 2015).

⁴¹ Nurcholis Madjid, *The True Face of Islam: Essays on Islam and Modernity in Indonesia* (Ciputat: Voice Center Indonesia, 2003); “Islam Indonesia Menatap Masa Depan: Aktualisasi Ajaran Ahlussunah Waljamaah” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 118.

given a strong tackle from the radicals and the conservatives. The term 'liberal' is now understood as indicating infidelity.⁴² So did Gusdur and Cak Nur have been suspected.⁴³

Notwithstanding this, the conservatism of Islam can also be found in Majelis Ulama Indonesia (The Council of Indonesian Clerics—MUI).⁴⁴ MUI itself was built by Indonesia's second president, Soeharto, in the interest of controlling the *ummah* (Muslim community).⁴⁵ To have his program successful, Soeharto needed to make sure that the *ummah* support him. Given that Ulama (clerics, Islamic intellectual) has a huge power on ruling the voice of *ummah*, Soeharto has to either cooperate or domesticate Ulama. He created MUI. With every Islamic organization has its representative at MUI⁴⁶, MUI then is perceived as the most authoritative Islamic organization even though such claim can be contested. This perception remains still even when MUI changes its position from the servant of the government to the servant of the *ummah*.⁴⁷ Perhaps, it simply because MUI's fatwa (decision concerning any issues about whether or not they are prohibited in Islam) is often used as justification for governmental policy.⁴⁸ Issuing fatwas itself is the main task of MUI.⁴⁹ Other than that, MUI monopolizes halal certification.⁵⁰ In Indonesia, seller and producer need to get a halal logo, issued by MUI, to guarantee that the product can be safely consumed by Muslims. Even though there are diverse Indonesia's Islamic organization, there is only MUI who has that chance. With its conservatism, its authoritative fatwas challenge the progressive discourse of Islam.

2. Islamic Radicalisation and a Setback of Religious Tolerance

Besides 'the conservative turn', post-1998 Indonesia also witnessed the growth of Islamic radicalisation. Minako Sakai and Amelia Fauzia articulate a survey concluding that the percentage of radical Islam has reached 20% of the population.⁵¹ However, undergoing a research to students, SETARA Institute⁵² *Laporan Survei Toleransi Siswa SMA Negeri di Jakarta dan Bandung Raya (Survey Report of High School Students' Tolerance in Jakarta and Greater Bandung)* (Jakarta, 2016). found that only 2.4% of them are radical, while almost 36% of the respondents considered conservative. Mahyudin, deputy speaker of the People's Consultative Assembly of Indonesia, on the other hand, perceives that radical Muslims are no more than 7.7% of the Muslim

⁴² Mohamad Abdun Nasir, "The 'Ulamā', Fatāwā and Challenges to Democracy in Contemporary Indonesia" (2014) 25:4 *Islam Christ Relat* 489.

⁴³ See Abu Bakar Ba'asyir, *Catatan dari Penjara untuk Mengamalkan dan Menegakkan Dinul Islam* (Depok: Penerbit Mushaf, 2006); van Bruinessen, *supra* note 4.

⁴⁴ Van Bruinessen, *supra* note 4.

⁴⁵ Moch Nur Ichwan, "Toward the Puritanical Moderate Islam: The Majelis Ulama Indonesia and the Politics of Orthodoxy" in Martin van Bruinessen, ed, *Contemp Dev Indones Islam Explain Conserv Turn* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013) 60.

⁴⁶ Human Rights Watch, *supra* note 16.

⁴⁷ Ichwan, *supra* note 45.

⁴⁸ Human Rights Watch, *supra* note 16.

⁴⁹ Piers Gillespie, "Current Issues in Indonesian Islam: Analysing the 2005 Council of Indonesian Ulama Fatwa No. 7 Opposing Pluralism, Liberalism and Secularism" (2007) 18:2 *J Islam Stud* 202; Nasir, *supra* note 42; Zainul Fuad, *Religious Pluralism in Indonesia: Muslim-Christian Discourse* Universitas Hamburg, 2007) [unpublished].

⁵⁰ Tim Lindsey, "Monopolising Islam: The Indonesian Ulama Council and state regulation of the 'Islamic economy'" (2012) 48:2 *Bull Indones Econ Stud* 253.

⁵¹ Sakai and Fauzia, *supra* note 20.

⁵² SETARA Institute, *Laporan Survei Toleransi Siswa SMA Negeri di Jakarta dan Bandung Raya (Survey Report of High School Students' Tolerance in Jakarta and Greater Bandung)* (Jakarta, 2016).

population.⁵³ Nevertheless, Wahid Foundation found that out of 207 million of Indonesian Muslims, 600 thousand of them have ever done violence in the name of jihad while another 11 million of the population are potentially being radical if they are given a chance.⁵⁴ This means that Sakai and Fauzia appear to be overestimated. However, this does not necessarily mean that Islamic radicalisation is less threatening. As to reify the threat, let us at first deconstruct the concept of radical Islam. The classification of Islam as moderate and radical was flourished after 9/11 attack to distinguish Muslims based on their attitude toward violence.

Nevertheless, violence is not the only intersection between moderate and radical Islam. There are three characteristics given to radical Islam. First is its ambition on enacting caliphate.⁵⁵ Second is its literal interpretation of Islamic thinking and scriptural sources.⁵⁶ Third is its tendency on undergoing violence, if necessary, to achieve its aim and goal. In the context of Indonesia, it seems that for an organization to be regarded radical, there is no need to embrace all characteristics. Most likely, they embrace two out of three. HTI (*Hizbut Tahrir* Indonesia—Indonesian Liberation Party), for instance, claims that its campaign on caliphate does not justify the using of violence. FPI (*Front Pembela Islam*—Islamic Defender Front), on the other hand, is often linked with violence but does not explicitly campaigning the enactment of the caliphate. There were Jamaah Islamiyah (Islamic Congregation—JI) and Laskar Jihad (Jihad Fighters—LJ) that embrace all characteristics. Both of them, however, have been disbanded.

Thus, the growth of Islamic radicalisation often puts to blame the influence of Salafi Wahabi movement (from Saudi Arabia) and transnational organizations such as Ikhwanul Muslimin (Muslim Brotherhood) (from Egypt) and Hizbut Tahrir (Liberation Party) (from Palestine). With Middle East money, Salafi Wahabi movement builds schools and enlarges its influence, helped by their expertise in optimizing internet and technology.⁵⁷ Ikhwanul Muslimin, on the other hand, manifested as Tarbiyah Movement which later transformed into *Partai Keadilan Sejahtera* (Prosperous Justice Party—PKS⁵⁸)⁵⁹. Hizbut Tahrir set up its branch and went to the name of Hizbut Tahrir

⁵³ Advertorial Kompas, “Mahyudin: 45 Persen Orang Beragama di Indonesia Tidak Paham Toleransi (Mahyudin: 45 Per Cent of Religious People in Indonesia Dot Not Understand Tolerance)”, *Kompas.com* (7 September 2016).

⁵⁴ Wahid Foundation, “Seperti Apakah Wajah Muslim Indonesia? (How Indonesian Muslims’ Face Looklike?)”, (2016), online: *Wahid Found* <<https://www.facebook.com/wahidfoundation/videos/1251828724879386/>>.

⁵⁵ Ainur Rofiq al-Amin, *Membongkar Proyek Khilafah Ala Hizbut Tahrir di Indonesia* (Yogyakarta: Penerbit LKiS, 2012); Azyumardi Azra, “Political Islam in post-Soeharto Indonesia” (2004) *Islam Perspect New Millemm* 133; Ba’asyir, *supra* note 43; Wasisto Raharjo Jati, “Radicalism in the Perspective of Islamic-Populism: Trajectory of Political Islam in Indonesia” (2013) 07:02 *J Indones Islam*; Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman, “Reviving the Caliphate in the Nusantara: Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia’s Mobilization Strategy and Its Impact in Indonesia” (2010) 22:4 *Terror Polit Violence* 601.

⁵⁶ Azyumardi Azra, “Islam in Southeast Asia: Tolerance and Radicalism” (2005) Miegunyah Public Lect 1; Hasan Noorhaidi, “Salafis Madrasas and Islamic Radicalism in Post-New Order Indonesia” in Kamaruzzaman Bustamam-Ahmad & P Jory, eds, *Islam Stud Islam Educ Contemp Southeast Asia* (Kuala Lumpur, 2011) 93; van Bruinessen, *supra* note 4.

⁵⁷ Noorhaidi, *supra* note 56.

⁵⁸ Tarbiyah Movement then transform into *Partai Keadilan Sejahtera* (Prosperous Justice Party—PKS). It is claimed to be one of the most important Islamist party Kikue Hamayotsu, “Beyond faith and identity: mobilizing Islamic youth in a democratic Indonesia” (2011) 24:2 *Pac Rev* 225; Ali, *supra* note 38; Bianca J Smith & Saipul Hamdi, “Between Sufi and Salafi subjects; female leadership, spiritual power and gender matters in Lombok” in Bianca J Smith & Mark Woodward, eds, *Gen Power Indones Islam Lead Fem Sufis Pesantren Selves* (New York: Routledge, 2013) 25.. PKS is inspired by the Ikhwan al-Muslimun (Muslim Brotherhood), founded by Hasan al-Banna in Egypt in 1928 and Salafi Wahabi movement Mark Woodward, Ali Amin & Inayah Rohmaniyah, “Lessons from Aceh Terrorist De-Radicalization” (2010) Ariz

Indonesia (HTI).⁶⁰ However, this does not to say that all variants of radical Islam are imported. Some of them are notably home-grown. Greg Fealy even argues that radical Islam is, in fact, a smaller piece of a fuller picture of Indonesia's Islam.⁶¹ It was Kartosuwiryo who proclaimed the establishment of Negara Islam Indonesia (NII—Indonesian Islamic State) as the follow-up of his Darul Islam (DI—Islamic State) movement.⁶² He continued exercising rebellion to Soekarno's regime as he was dissatisfied with Indonesia's ideology and governmental system. Kartosuwiryo was then beheaded, but his idea continued to flourish.

During the reign of New Order Regime, DI had been secretly domesticated and then used as the watchdog by the government. Quinton Temby on *Imagining an Islamic State in Indonesia: From Darul Islam to Jemaah Islamiyah* argues that DI optimized such a situation to survive.⁶³ In so doing, it flexibly transformed into various radical organizations, waiting for momentum. The momentum came when the regime fell. The coming of Reformation era was marked with the challenges from DI's predecessor such as Komando Jihad (Jihad Command), Dewan Dakwah Islam Indonesia (DDII—The Council of Indonesian Islamic Preaching), Jamaah Islamiyah (JI—Islamic Congregation), and Majelis Mujahidin Indonesia (MII—The Indonesian Mujahidin Council). It was exacerbated, as I have argued earlier, by the vulnerability of inter-religion and inter-group tolerance as the impact of the prohibition of SARA's discussion during the reign of the regime. Up to this day, Indonesia has challenged by many terrorist attacks from Bali bombings in 2002 to Kampung Melayu's bombing this year.⁶⁴ The Bali bombings underwent by JI and killed around 200 people. Kampung Melayu's bombings victimized 15 people, some of them are police officers.⁶⁵ Furthermore, ISIS has declared to be in Southeast Asia and stated that Indonesia is one of its targets⁶⁶. Its campaign, sadly, is supported by radical Indonesian Muslims.⁶⁷

Despite its tendency to violence, an alarming situation from Islamic radicalisation is the absence of equality and justice. This could be the case given that in the radical conception of the caliphate, non-Muslims seem to be regarded as a second-class

State Univ Consort Strateg Commun.. It is suspected as holding hidden agenda to establish Islamic State and anti-Pancasila. However, for political purposes, PKS transform into a more nationalist party.

⁵⁹ Woodward, Amin & Rohmaniyah, *supra* note 58.

⁶⁰ Osman, *supra* note 55; al-Amin, *supra* note 55.

⁶¹ Fealy, "Islamic Radicalism in Indonesia: The Faltering Revival?" (2004) Southeast Asian Aff 104.

⁶² Kikue Hamayotsu, "Islam and the Making of the Nation: Kartosuwiryo and Political Islam in 20th Century Indonesia by Chiara Formichi" (2015) 100 Indonesia 125; Norshahril Saat, "Kartosuwiryo dan NII: Kajian Ulang Azyumardi" (2014) 21:1 Stud Islam.

⁶³ Temby, "Imagining an Islamic State in Indonesia: From Darul Islam to Jemaah Islamiyah" (2010) 89 Indonesia 1.

⁶⁴ Mirra Noor Milla, Faturachman & Djamaludin Ancok, "The impact of leader-follower interactions on the radicalization of terrorists: A case study of the Bali bombers" (2013) 16:2 Asian J Soc Psychol 92; see Azyumardi Azra, "Bali and Southeast Asian Islam: Debunking the Myths" (2003) Afre Bali Threat Terror Southeast Asia 39; Jeffrey A Ritchey & Nurhaya Muchtar, "Indonesian Pesantren and Community Social Change: Moderate Islam's Use of Media and Technology for Nonformal, Community-Based Education" (2000) 420; Muhammad Sirozi, "The Intellectual Roots of Islamic Radicalism in Indonesia" (2005) 95 Muslim World 81.

⁶⁵ Ambaranie Nadia Kemala Movanita, "Ini Daftar Nama Korban Bom Kampung Melayu yang Berhasil Diidentifikasi", *Kompas.com* (25 May 2017).

⁶⁶ Anna Scott Bell & Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman, "ISIS and Islamic Radicalization in Southeast Asia: An Interview with Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman" (2015) Georget J Asian Aff 158; James Griffiths, "ISIS in Southeast Asia: Philippines battles growing threat", *CNN* (30 May 2017).

⁶⁷ See Haeril Halim & Marguerite Afra Sapiie, "Fear of more local attack as Indonesian millitants fail to emigrate", *Jkt Post* (11 January 2017).

citizen.⁶⁸ Abu Bakar Ba'asyir, the leader and founder of JI, even clearly states that Muslims with a different understanding of Islam can be easily considered blasphemy or become infidel as they can be permissively killed.⁶⁹ However, for radical Islamic organizations motor or mobilize such radical action, they need to make their campaign in line with the meta-narrative of Indonesian Muslims. For Merlyna Lim, the meta-narrative of Indonesian Muslims are religiosity and nationalism.⁷⁰ Since the radical Muslims believe that nationalism is a falsehood⁷¹, religiosity is the only meta-narrative they can manipulate. It could be easier for the radicals to manipulate the religiosity given the commonality between them with the conservative Muslims in interpreting religiosity. Not only this makes the distinction between moderate and radical Islam not as clear as it is conceptualized, but also this leads to two conditions. First is that a Muslim can hold, at the very same time, in a degree or two, both moderate and radical views of Islam. Second is that radical Islamic organizations can take benefit from movement taken by the conservatives. It relates to the assumption that MUI is perceived as the most authoritative conservative and that it concerns on issuing fatwas.

That says MUI's fatwas can be used as justification for the radicals to undergo action and violence. For instance, MUI's anti-pluralism, liberalism, and secularism fatwa in 2005 has sparked anti-pluralism speech which strengthens anti-liberal attitude.⁷² It has situated the like of liberal thinkers as the opponent of Islamic orthodoxy. In 1980, MUI issued a fatwa about the deviance of Ahmadiyya; by 2005, FPI used its fatwa to attack Ahmadiyya members in Parung which was followed in the following year by a similar attack happened in West Lombok. In 2008 another fatwa about Ahmadiyya was released, and in 2011, Ahmadiyya members in Pandeglang were attacked by locals.⁷³ They are marginalized given that MUI's fatwa on them is supported by the government through the issuance of *Surat Ketetapan Bersama* (Joint Ministerial Decree—SKB).⁷⁴ SETARA Institute recorded an increasing attack to Ahmadiyya from three cases in 2006 to 50 and 114 in 2010 and 2011, respectively.⁷⁵ Ahmadiyya is not the only victim. In 2011, the members of Shia were suffered from bully and attack undergone by FPI. Human Rights Watch notes that since 2005 to 2010 430 churches were forced to shut down.⁷⁶ In 2012, FPI was responsible for forcing 19 worshipping places to close while a fatwa issued by MUI of East Java about Shia has ended up in attack and eviction to Shia members in Sampang. Sadly, police and government were reportedly did nothing to stop such action. They championed the majority's arrogance, or, they just simply avoid fighting against these violent radical groups. On Mark Woodward's phrase⁷⁷, "MUI does not encourage or promote violence but has established a discursive frame that enables

⁶⁸ See Ba'asyir, *supra* note 43; Woodward, Amin & Rohmaniyah, *supra* note 58.

⁶⁹ Ba'asyir, *supra* note 43.

⁷⁰ Lim, "Islamic Radicalism and Anti-Americanism in Indonesia: The Role of the Internet" (2005) 18 Policy Stud 1.

⁷¹ See *ibid.*

⁷² Ichwan, *supra* note 45.

⁷³ Florian Pohl, "Negotiating Religious and National Identities in Contemporary Indonesian Islamic Education" (2011) 61:3 CrossCurrents 399.

⁷⁴ Ahmad Najib Burhani, "Hating the Ahmadiyya: The place of 'heretics' in contemporary Indonesian Muslim society" (2014) 8:2 Contemp Islam 133.

⁷⁵ Human Rights Watch, *supra* note 16.

⁷⁶ Human Rights Watch, *Ibid.*

⁷⁷ Woodward, "The Islamic Defenders Front: Demonization, Violence and the State in Indonesia" (2014) 8:2 Contemp Islam 153.

it, allowing FPI and other perpetrators to define sectarian violence as defense of Indonesia and Islam.”

Aside from this, there is another threatening factor to religious tolerance when the conservatives and the radicals pose a huge power, which is blasphemy law. The law can be condemned to a minority which its distinctions could be regarded as blasphemous, to liberal Muslims whose contextualization is considered endangering Islamic orthodoxy, and indeed to non-Muslims. The very recent case was the case of Basuki Tjahaja Purnama (Ahok). Ahok was prosecuted for being blasphemous to Quran. His guilt was legitimized by MUI’s fatwa, supported, unsurprisingly, by a coalition of radical organizations, namely GNPf-MUI (*Gerakan Nasional Pembela Fatwa-MUI*—The National Movement to Guard MUI Fatwa). GNPf-MUI has undergone series of action namely *Aksi Bela Islam* (The Act of Defending Islam). As Fealy found, this series of actions gained support from numerous conservative Muslims.⁷⁸ The moment was used by radical organizations to gain more supporters and popularity. HTI tried to enlarge its campaign on caliphate but ended up being disbanded by the government.⁷⁹ FPI, on the other hand, has its leader cast as the biggest leader of Indonesia’s Muslims without a need to ask an agreement from, say, ‘non-FPI’ Muslims.⁸⁰

Blasphemy law is indeed situated to protect the rights of religious life and to maintain reciprocal inter-religion respect. However, as can be seen quite clear, this law could be very harmful and violent, thanks to the radicals’ judgmental attitude and self-righteousness and the conservatives’ rigid understanding of Islam.⁸¹ In the case of Ahok, blasphemy law seems to be situated as to hijack the candidacy of Ahok as Jakarta’s governor. That says religion appears to be situated as a political commodity. Unfortunately, the inter-group and inter-religion sentiment escalated during the campaign, is not over even when the election has done. Fealy, for example, assumes that there is a growing anti-Chinese and anti-Christian sentiments in the aftermath of the series of *Aksi Bela Islam* (The Act of Defending Islam).⁸² In Bandung, a Christmas celebration was dismissed by a group of Muslims.⁸³ If it is the case, then the coming of West Java’s gubernatorial election in 2018 and the presidential election in the following year will once again contest the strength of Indonesia’s religious tolerance. SETARA Institute recorded an increasing number of religious intolerance from 216 cases in 2010 to 244 and 264 cases in 2011 and 2012, respectively.⁸⁴ Would this trend increase as it is intensified by political tension?

⁷⁸ Fealy, “Bigger than Ahok: explaining the 2 December mass rally”, (2016), online: *Indones Melb* <<http://indonesiaatmelbourne.unimelb.edu.au/bigger-than-ahok-explaining-jakartas-2-december-mass-rally/>>.

⁷⁹ BBC Indonesia, “Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia dibubarkan Pemerintah (Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia is Disbanded by the Government)”, *BBC Indones* (8 May 2017).

⁸⁰ Ahmad Reza, “Habib Rizieq Jadi Imam Besar Umat Islam Indonesia, Siapa Kasih Mandat? (Habib Rizieq Casts as The Biggest Leader of Indonesian Muslims, Mandate from Whom?)”, *Sword* (9 January 2017).

⁸¹ Ismatu Ropi, “Islamic Religious Texts Must be Read in Context to Understand Blasphemy”, (2016), online: *Jkt Post* <<http://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2016/12/02/islamic-religious-texts-must-be-read-in-context-to-understand-blasphemy.html>>; Kikue Hamayotsu, “The Limits of Civil Society in Democratic Indonesia: Media Freedom and Religious Intolerance” (2013) 43:4 *J Contemp Asia* 658; see Burhani, *supra* note 74; Ichwan, *supra* note 45; Human Rights Watch, *supra* note 16; Merlyna Lim, “Many Clicks but Little Sticks: Social Media Activism in Indonesia” (2013) 43:4 *J Contemp Asia* 636.

⁸² Fealy, *supra* note 78.

⁸³ The Jakarta Times, “Aksi Pelarangan Natal di Bandung, Bentuk Pengkhianatan Konstitusional”, (2016), online: *Jkt Times*.

⁸⁴ Human Rights Watch, *supra* note 16.

3. Closed-mindedness, Homogeneity, and Judgmental Attitude

I have shown, at first, that symbolic violence is inevitable given Islam turns, by chance, to be the majority. The task remained, therefore, is to eradicate harm caused by symbolic violence, either by preventing physical violence or by strengthening equality, fairness, and justice. I have also argued that an effort has been showed yet it is challenged by the counterproductive movement made by the conservatives and the radicals. It is supported by Wahid Foundation who states that Indonesian Muslims are still tolerant⁸⁵. For instance, it articulates that 72% of Indonesian Muslims deny radical Islam, more than 88% support religious freedom, 65% of them believe that the government should protect diverse schools of thought, 82,3% of them support Pancasila and the Constitution of Indonesia, while 67,3% of them agree with democracy. However, it also found that there is an increasing tendency of religious intolerance. This phenomenon, perhaps, is escalated by the conservatives and the radicals' access to policymaking. With power on their hand, marginalization to a minority can be worse.

Thus, these are not the only challenges. The fact that Islam has a much higher proportion than other religions and beliefs combined could make a homogenous environment. That is to say, not all Muslims have access to interact, communicate, and befriend non-Muslims, let alone in such a deep friendship. Many of them are localized in such a homogenous Muslim environment, where nearly all of their relatives and friends are Muslims. Such a homogeneity could strengthen the normalization of privileges as well as the failure of recognizing minority's rights. The lack of inter-group and inter-religion interaction, communication, and friendship would make it hard to put minority's voice into realization. This is exacerbated by the prohibition of SARA's discussion. With the lack of chance to get to know each other, to create a deep and reciprocal inter-group or inter-religion understanding, what might come is prejudice. When prejudice is on the front, hatred will be easier to be cultivated than love and companionship. A video showing a group of children marches and chants about 'killing Ahok' at 24 May in Jakarta can be situated as an example.⁸⁶ In this regard, hatred is reproduced and installed to children. Wahid Foundation underlines that despite a literal understanding of jihad, hate speech and provocative preaching are the factors of Islamic radicalisation.⁸⁷ There is also an indication of anti-Christian and anti-Semitic sentiments flourished as, say, inherited phobia and conflict, cited in Scriptures and the history of Islam. Included in this sentiment is the anti-Western and anti-America sentiments⁸⁸. The sentiments come stronger given the lack of inter-religion dialogue and the reproduction of prejudice. Aside from this is anti-Chinese sentiment as argued by Fealy.⁸⁹ This sentiment grows as the effect of New Order Regime's oppression to this race and its

⁸⁵ Wahid Foundation, *supra* note 54.

⁸⁶ See BBC Indonesia, "Teriakan anak-anak 'bunuh si Ahok' di pawai Obor 'bisa berbahaya' (Children's Chanting of 'Killing Ahok' during Obor March Could be Dangerous)", *BBC Indones* (26 May 2017).

⁸⁷ Wahid Foundation, *supra* note 54.

⁸⁸ Lim, *supra* note 70; see James J Fox, "Currents in Contemporary Islam in Indonesia" (2004) *Harv Asia Vis* 21 1; Ronald A Lukens-Bull, *Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia: Continuity and Conflict* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013); Martin A Miller, *The Foundations of Modern Terrorism: State, Society and the Dynamics of Political Violence* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013); Akh Muzakki, "The Roots, Strategies, and Popular Perception of Islamic Radicalism in Indonesia" (2014) 08:01 *J Indones Islam* 1; Suprayetno Wagiman, *The Modernization of the Pesantren's Educational System to Meet the Needs of Indonesian Communities* McGill University, 1997) [unpublished].

⁸⁹ Fealy, *supra* note 78.

narratives toward Communism and Partai Komunis Indonesia (Indonesia's Communist Party—PKI).⁹⁰

Being trapped in such a homogenous environment and happened to be the majority would lead Muslims to the feeling of superiority.⁹¹ Therefore, this is unsurprising to see how SETARA Institute found that the top ten least tolerant cities are majority Muslim cities.⁹² This perhaps proves how homogeneity that isolates Muslims from inter-group and inter-religion dialogue could prevent them realize, let alone respect, others' rights. This claim is supported by John Dewey, a well-known philosopher, who emphasizes the needs of inter-group interaction. For him, "isolationism is self-oppression".⁹³ Dewey believes that diversity is not only enriching but also enlightening. This could help people grow as to sustain the pluralistic democratic society. In line with this is the finding of SETARA Institute which shows that the top ten most tolerant cities have a rather balanced composition between Muslim and non-Muslim, or even have Muslims become a minority.⁹⁴

However, such an interaction and dialogue would unlikely happen if there is an unwillingness to open up the mind. Sadly, it seems that the conservatives and the radicals are closed-minded, specifically when comes to Islamic values, norms, and principles. Of course, such closed-mindedness, despite capable of isolating them from widening up their viewpoint as to see things through others' eyes, could also lead to logical fallacies and self-righteousness. For example, while I attended BAKOMUBIN (*Badan Koordinasi Mubaligh Indonesia*—Coordination Body of Indonesia's Islamic Preachers) conference at MPR (*Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat*—The People's Consultative Assembly of the Republic of Indonesia), the discussion went on to the assumption that even though Muslims are the majority in Indonesia, they are always oppressed and marginalized. The leader of BAKOMUBIN, Deddy Ismatullah, states that the solution is to establish sharia as the basis of law.⁹⁵ He argues that Indonesia's ideology and governmental system is compatible with sharia. Such a campaign, as far as equality is the concern, illustrates the failure of contesting privileges and realizing minority's rights.

Such a closed-mindedness appears to be exacerbated by a poor rank of literacy. From 61 countries surveyed by Central Connecticut State University, Indonesia got the second rank from the bottom.⁹⁶ When comes to education, following problems are founded. Research taken by SETARA Institute to high school students in Jakarta and Bandung Raya shows how students learn religion mainly from religion teachers.⁹⁷

⁹⁰ John Braithwaite et al, *Anomie and Violence: Non Truth and Reconciliation in Indonesian Peacebuilding* (Canberra: ANU E Press, 2010); Fuad, *supra* note 49; The Jakarta Post, "Fear of Communism Based on Ignorance, Expert Says", (2016), online: *Jkt Post* <<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CdZfChcZppY>>.

⁹¹ see Lim, *supra* note 70; Ronald Niezen, *A World Beyond Difference: Cultural Identity in the Age of Globalization* (2004).

⁹² SETARA Institute, *Tolerant City Index 2015* (Jakarta, 2015).

⁹³ Dewey in Jim Garrison & Alven Neiman, "Pragmatism and Education" in P Brantlinger & William B Thesing, eds, *Companion Vic Nov* (London: Blakwell Publishers Ltd, 2002) at 27.

⁹⁴ SETARA Institute, *supra* note 92.

⁹⁵ Deddy Ismatullah, *Problem dan Tantangan Penerapan Hukum Islam di Indonesia (Problems and Challenges of the Implementation of Islamic Law in Indonesia)* (Jakarta, 2017).

⁹⁶ J W Miller & M C McKenna, "Rank Breakdown", (2016), online: *World Most Lit Nation* <<http://www.ccsu.edu/wmln/rank.html>>; A Gunawan, "Indonesia Second Least Literate of 61 Nations", (2016), online: *Jkt Post* <<http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/03/12/indonesia-second-least-literate-61-nations.html>>.

⁹⁷ SETARA Institute, *Laporan Survei Toleransi Siswa SMA Negeri di Jakarta dan Bandung Raya (Survey Report of High School Students' Tolerance in Jakarta and Greater Bandung)* (Jakarta, 2016).

However, not all religion teachers hold a moderate view of Islam, let alone are qualified. Parker states that many teachers deny teaching pluralism in school while 87% of them deny teaching other religion.⁹⁸ Recent surveys show that 78% of religion teachers agree for the implementation of sharia as the majority of the respondents believe that such implementation is in line with Indonesia's ideology.⁹⁹ With such belief, 77% of the respondents support Islamic organization that campaigns for the establishment of sharia. Surprisingly, 82% of the respondents have taught about the caliphate in schools even though such concept is not available on school's textbooks. In terms of minority's rights, 81% of the respondents deny the idea of building other-religions' worshipping place in their area, while nearly the same percentage goes for avoidance in helping the member of the minor group Islam, namely, Shia and Ahmadiyya. Students interviewed by SETARA Institute states that they have no issue in befriending someone from a different religion. 95.2% of them even feel that it is necessary to help people regardless of their religions. They do not agree with caliphate and consider the like of ISIS as a terrorist. However, when comes to minor sects such as Shia and Ahmadiyya, 57.6% claim that they have never heard such sects, but the majority of the respondent agree that these sects must be limited. Given the instrumentality of education in the maintenance of the society, this display is alarming.¹⁰⁰

Notwithstanding this, the numbers of teachers of Islamic subject are far insufficient.¹⁰¹ This could make the teaching of Islamic subject will be undergone by unqualified teachers. This alone is worrying yet this is not the only problem of Indonesia's education. It also needs to solve the poor quality of textbooks¹⁰² and reform the teacher-centred pedagogy which gives too many emphasises on memorization.¹⁰³ For Freire, either poor quality of textbooks or teacher-centred pedagogy is capable of distancing students from reality, as well as hindering their capacities to contextualize, criticize, and deepening their understanding.¹⁰⁴ As a result, students will be less critical. To solve this problem, Freire offers a problem-posing pedagogy which accommodates contextualization, critical thinking, and dialogue. On a degree or two, problem-posing pedagogy is in line with Ibn Khaldun's experiential learning.¹⁰⁵ That is in the sense that it situates student as an active learner. Nevertheless, Wood¹⁰⁶ and Christodoulou¹⁰⁷ might argue for the sake of memorization benefit. For them, memorization could help to provide prior knowledge. However, their argument does not deny the importance of critical thinking. In fact, prior knowledge would be of no benefit if it does not being contextualized. Contextualization, on the other hand, is the aim of Freire's problem-posing pedagogy and is a characteristic of critical thinking.

⁹⁸ Parker, *supra* note 15.

⁹⁹ see Media Indonesia, "Wawasan Kebangsaan Guru PAI Perlu Diperkuat", *Media Indones* (20 December 2016).

¹⁰⁰ See Nailufar, *supra* note 23.

¹⁰¹ Bandung Express, "Jumlah Guru PAI Kurang Banyak", *Jabar Express* (2 February 2016).

¹⁰² UNESCO, "Country Report: Indonesia Indonesian Public Policies on Inclusive Education" (2008) 21.

¹⁰³ see Daniel Suryadarma & Gavin W Jones, "Meeting the Education Challenge" in Daniel Suryadarma & Gavin W Jones, eds, *Educ Indones* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013).

¹⁰⁴ Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1996).

¹⁰⁵ see Basma Ahmad Sedki Dajani, "The Ideal Education in Ibn Khaldun's Muqaddimah" (2015) 192 *Procedia - Soc Behav Sci* 308.

¹⁰⁶ "Reconceptualising Child-Centred Education: contemporary directions in policy, theory and practice in early childhood" (2007) 49:1 *Forum (Genova)* 119.

¹⁰⁷ Christodoulou, *Seven Myths about Education* (London: Routledge, 2014).

In defining critical thinking itself, I will depend on Sharon Bailin and Harvey Segel whose definition of critical thinking can be found at *The Blackwell Guide to the Philosophy of Education*.¹⁰⁸ For them, thinking becomes critical if it “meets relevant standards or criteria of acceptability”.¹⁰⁹ It also has to have general applicability as well as contextual. They argue that critical thinking is built upon skill and disposition. Kurfiss states that skill makes an individual’s thinking process can be justified and contested.¹¹⁰ Disposition, on the other hand, is composed by open-mindedness, fair-mindedness, independent-mindedness, curiosity, and respect for another viewpoint.¹¹¹ Joe Kincheloe on *Knowledge and Critical Pedagogy*¹¹² and Jennifer Moon on *Critical Thinking: an Exploration of Theory and Practice*¹¹³ argue that critical thinking is an act of reasoning, meaning-making, and contextualizing. Dewey¹¹⁴ seems unlikely to use the term ‘critical thinking’. However, he has drawn the idea of reflecting thinking which, by and large, constitutes the spirit of critical thinking. What Dewey means by reflecting thinking is the act of problematizing, identifying, hypothesizing, reasoning, and experimenting. Moreover, even Dewey defines thinking as questioning.

Critical thinking could widen up people’s viewpoint. Such enlargement will, therefore, include the recognition of others’ viewpoints and claims of truth. Ideally speaking, an open-minded Muslim will believe in her or his Islamic virtue while at the same time has no issue in recognizing and respecting other’s belief. This is because they have opened up their mind for their can truly recognize diversity and therefore have no appeal on becoming a self-righteous person. With this in mind, critical thinking would not make a Muslim judgmental. Judgemental attitude, as I have shown earlier, is capable of provoking conflict.¹¹⁵ Nevertheless, this not the only impact critical thinking could bring about. An attitude of questioning, examining, reasoning, contextualizing, problematizing, and meaning-making, will eventually make an individual difficult to be manipulated and radicalized, let alone being politicized. They will be hardly indoctrinated. If it is the case, then by long-term, critical thinking will curb Islamic radicalisation. Even if Bruinessen is correct when arguing ‘the conservative turn’¹¹⁶, critical thinking seems likely to be a counterbalance alternative since this would lead Muslims to be more contextual in interpreting Islamic thinking.

III. CONCLUSION

Bourdieu’s idea of symbolic violence cannot be separated from his idea of ‘field’. Since every individual is driven by her or his interest, to a certain extent, such a situation could create a domination which he believes will be followed by inequality, privilege, social hierarchy, and the lack of recognition for the minority. I have shown that in terms of numbers, the Muslim community is arguably far way dominant. Its domination has

¹⁰⁸ Bailin and Segel, “Critical Thinking” in Nigel Blake et al, eds, *Blackwell Guide Philos Educ* (Oxfo: Blackwell Publishing, 2008) 181.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid* at 181.

¹¹⁰ “Critical Thinking: Theory, Research, Practice, and Possibilities” (1988) 2 ASHE-ERIC High Educ Rep.

¹¹¹ Bailin & Siegel, *supra* note 108.

¹¹² J. Kincheloe, *Knowledge and Critical Pedagogy* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2008).

¹¹³ Moon, *Critical Thinking: an Exploration of Theory and Practice* (London: Routledge, 2007).

¹¹⁴ John Dewey, *How We Think* (Massachusetts: D.C. Heath and Company, 1993).

¹¹⁵ see Nurdin, *supra* note 38; Abd A’la, *Jahiliyah Kontemporer dan Hegemoni Nalar Kekerasan: Merajut Islam Indonesia Membangun Peradaban Dunia* (Yogyakarta: PT LKiS Printing Cemerlang, 2014); Sirozi, *supra* note 64.

¹¹⁶ Van Bruinessen, *supra* note 4.

reached to socio-cultural and political hegemonies. I have articulated that although Indonesia's law is not based on sharia, Indonesian Muslims enjoy privileges to the degree that these are taken for granted. On the other hand, the fact that Indonesian Muslims commonly live in such a homogenous Islamic environment makes they are less capable of recognizing minority's voice. I have drawn a question about whether Islamic radicalisation put religious tolerance in a setback. I found that it appears to be the case given the radicals' closed-mindedness, self-righteousness, and judgemental attitude would drive them to provoke violence, physically and symbolically. Sadly, such characteristics can also be found in Islamic conservatism. This makes the situation far more challenging specifically when religious sentiment is politicized.

Therefore, an encouragement of inter-group and inter-religion dialogues is necessary. This requires an openness to realize, reconcile, and embrace diversity. In so doing, exposing Indonesian Muslims to a heterogeneous environment would be of some benefits. Aside from this is the cultivation of critical thinking. The former could distance Muslims from their privileges as they will be capable of contesting it. The latter, on the other hand, could deepen the understanding of Islam as it encourages contextualization. This can be started in schools, legitimized by the government, supported by the community. Other than that, minority's voice needs to be heard, appreciated and accommodated. Somehow, this could be suspected as unIslamic by the conservatives and the radicals given their rigid and literal interpretation of Islam. However, these need to be taken anyway to accelerate the fulfilment of equality, fairness, religious tolerance, and justice in the interest of democratic society. Not only is this the responsibility of the country and the government but also the mission of each as humankind irrespective of her or his religion. This is in fact in line with the very mission of Islam itself which is to establish *maslahah al-ummah* (goodness of the society).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- A'la, Abd. *Jahiliyah Kontemporer dan Hegemoni Nalar Kekerasan: Merajut Islam Indonesia Membangun Peradaban Dunia* (Yogyakarta: PT LKiS Printing Cemerlang, 2014).
- al-Amin, Ainur Rofiq. *Membongkar Proyek Khilafah Ala Hizbut Tahrir di Indonesia* (Yogyakarta: Penerbit LKiS, 2012).
- Azra, Azyumardi. *The transmission of Islamic reformism to Indonesia: Networks of Middle Eastern and Malay-Indonesian "Ulama" in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries* 1992 [unpublished].
- Ba'asyir, Abu Bakar. *Catatan dari Penjara untuk Mengamalkan dan Menegakkan Dinul Islam* (Depok: Penerbit Mushaf, 2006).
- Baso, Ahmad. *NU Studies: Pergolakan Pemikiran antara Fundamentalisme Islam dan Fundamentalisme Neo-Liberal* (Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga, 2006).
- Bizawie, Zainul Milal. *Masterpiece Islam Nusantara: Sanad dan Jejaring Ulama-Santri (1830-1945)* (Tangerang: Pustaka Compass, 2016).
- Braithwaite, John et al. *Anomie and Violence: Non Truth and Reconciliation in Indonesian Peacebuilding* (Canberra: ANU E Press, 2010).

- Bruinessen, Martin et al van. *Contemporary Developments in Indonesian Islam: Explaining the "Conservative Turn"*, Martin van Bruinessen, ed. (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak, 2013).
- Christodoulou, D. *Seven Myths about Education* (London: Routledge, 2014).
- Dewey, John. *How We Think* (Massachusetts: D.C. Heath and Company, 1993).
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1996).
- Fuad, Zainul. *Religious Pluralism in Indonesia: Muslim-Christian Discourse* Universitas Hamburg, 2007) [unpublished].
- Grenfell, Michael. *Pierre Bourdieu: Key Concepts* (Acumen, 2012).
- Haq, Hamka. *Islam: Rahmah untuk Bangsa* (Jakarta: RMBOOKS, 2009).
- Human Rights Watch. *Atas Nama Agama: Pelanggaran terhadap Minoritas Agama di Indonesia* (New York: Human Rights Watch, 2013).
- Kamil, Sukron. *Islam dan Demokrasi: Telaah Konseptual dan Historis* (Jakarta: Gaya Media Pratama, 2002).
- Kincheloe, J L. *Knowledge and Critical Pedagogy* (Dordrecht: Springer, 2008).
- Lukens-Bull, Ronald A. *Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia: Continuity and Conflict* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013).
- Madjid, Nurcholish. *The True Face of Islam: Essays on Islam and Modernity in Indonesia* (Ciputat: Voice Center Indonesia, 2003).
- Miller, Martin A. *The Foundations of Modern Terrorism: State, Society and the Dynamics of Political Violence* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013).
- Moon, J. *Critical Thinking: an Exploration of Theory and Practice* (London: Routledge, 2007).
- Niezen, Ronald. *A World Beyond Difference: Cultural Identity in the Age of Globalization* (2004).
- Tim Penulis JNM. *Gerakan Kultural Islam Nusantara* (Yogyakarta: Jamaah Nahdliyin Mataram and Panitia Muktamar NU ke-33, 2015).
- Wagiman, Suprayetno. *The Modernization of the Pesantren's Educational System to Meet the Needs of Indonesian Communities* McGill University, 1997) [unpublished].
- Zaqzuq, Mahmud Hamdi. *Islam Dihujat Islam Menjawab: Tanggapan atas Tuduhan dan Kesalahpahaman* (Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2008).
- Abaza, Mona. "Asia Imagined by the Arabs" in Kamaruzzaman Bustamam-Ahmad & P Jory, eds, *Islam Stud Islam Educ Contemp Southeast Asia* (Kuala Lumpur: Yayasan Ilmuwan, 2011) 1.
- Advertorial Kompas. "Mahyudin: 45 Persen Orang Beragama di Indonesia Tidak Paham Toleransi (Mahyudin: 45 Per Cent of Religious People in Indonesia Dot Not Understand Tolerance)", *Kompas.com* (7 September 2016).
- Ali, Muhamad. "The Rise of the Liberal Islam Network (JIL) in Contemporary Indonesia" (2005) 22:1 Am J Islam Soc Sci 1.

- Azra, Azyumardi. "The Rise of Muslim Elite Schools: a New Pattern of 'Santrization' In Indonesia" (1999) 64:XII Al-Jamiah 63.
- . "Bali and Southeast Asian Islam : Debunking the Myths" (2003) *Aftre Bali Threat Terror Sourtheast Asia* 39.
- . "Political Islam in post-Soeharto Indonesia" (2004) *Islam Perspect New Millenn* 133.
- . "Islam in Southeast Asia: Tolerance and Radicalism" (2005) *Miegunyah Public Lect* 1.
- . "Jaringan Ulama Nusantara" in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 169.
- Bailin, Sharon & Harvey Siegel. "Critical Thinking" in Nigel Blake et al, eds, *Blackwell Guide Philos Educ* (Oxfo: Blackwell Publishing, 2008) 181.
- Bandung Express. "Jumlah Guru PAI Kurang Banyak", *Jabar Express* (2 February 2016).
- BBC Indonesia. "Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia dibubarkan Pemerintah (Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia is Disbanded by the Government)", *BBC Indones* (8 May 2017).
- . "Teriakan anak-anak 'bunuh si Ahok' di pawai Obor 'bisa berbahaya' (Children's Chanting of 'Killing Ahok' during Obor March Could be Dangerous)", *BBC Indones* (26 May 2017).
- Bell, Anna Scott & Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman. "ISIS and Islamic Radicalization in Southeast Asia: An Interview with Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman" (2015) *Georget J Asian Aff* 158.
- Bizawie, Zainul Milal. "Islam Nusantara sebagai Subjek dalam Islamic Studies: Lintas Diskursus dan Metodologis (Islam Nusantara as a Subject in Islamic Studies: Inter-Discourses and Methodologies)" in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 239.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. "Symbolic Power" (1979) 4 *Crit Anthropol* 77.
- Bruinessen, Martin Van. "Postscrip: the Survival of Liberal and Progressive Muslim Thought in Indonesia" in Martin van Bruinessen, ed, *Contemp Dev Indones Islam Explain Conserv Turn* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013).
- . "Overview of Muslim Organizations, Associations and Movements in Indonesia" in Martin van Bruinessen, ed, *Contemp Dev Indones Islam Explain Conserv Turn* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013) 21.
- Burhani, Ahmad Najib. "Lakum dīnukum wa-liya dīnī: the Muhammadiyah's stance towards interfaith relations" (2011) 22:3 *Islam Christ Relat* 329.
- . "Hating the Ahmadiyya: The place of 'heretics' in contemporary Indonesian Muslim society" (2014) 8:2 *Contemp Islam* 133.
- Dajani, Basma Ahmad Sedki. "The Ideal Education in Ibn Khaldun's Muqaddimah" (2015) 192 *Procedia - Soc Behav Sci* 308.
- Fealy, Greg. "Islamic Radicalism in Indonesia: The Faltering Revival?" (2004) *Southeast Asian Aff* 104.

- Federspiel, Howard M. "The Muhammadiyah: A Study of an Orthodox Islamic Movement in Indonesia" (1970) 10 *Indonesia* 57.
- Fox, James J. "Currents in Contemporary Islam in Indonesia" (2004) *Harv Asia Vis* 21 1.
- Garrison, Jim & Alven Neiman. "Pragmatism and Education" in P Brantlinger & William B Thesing, eds, *Companion Vic Nov* (London: Blakwell Publishers Ltd, 2002).
- Geertz, Clifford. "The Javanese Kijaji: The Changing Role of a Cultural Broker" (1960) 2:2 *Soc Comp Stud Soc Hist* 228.
- Gillespie, Piers. "Current Issues in Indonesian Islam: Analysing the 2005 Council of Indonesian Ulama Fatwa No. 7 Opposing Pluralism, Liberalism and Secularism" (2007) 18:2 *J Islam Stud* 202.
- Giora, E. "The Indonesian Model", *Jerus Post* (7 April 2014).
- Griffiths, James. "ISIS in Southeast Asia: Philippines battles growing threat", *CNN* (30 May 2017).
- Halim, Haeril & Marguerite Afra Sapiie. "Fear of more local attack as Indonesian militants fail to emigrate", *Jkt Post* (11 January 2017).
- Hamayotsu, Kikue. "Beyond faith and identity: mobilizing Islamic youth in a democratic Indonesia" (2011) 24:2 *Pac Rev* 225.
- . "The Limits of Civil Society in Democratic Indonesia: Media Freedom and Religious Intolerance" (2013) 43:4 *J Contemp Asia* 658.
- . "Islam and the Making of the Nation: Kartosuwiryo and Political Islam in 20th Century Indonesia by Chiara Formichi" (2015) 100 *Indonesia* 125.
- Hassan, Riaz. "On Being Religious: Patterns of Religious Commitment in Muslim Societies" (2007) 97 *Muslim World* 437.
- Ichwan, Moch Nur. "Toward the Puritanical Moderate Islam: The Majelis Ulama Indonesia and the Politics of Orthodoxy" in Martin van Bruinessen, ed, *Contemp Dev Indones Islam Explain Conserv Turn* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013) 60.
- Jati, Wasisto Raharjo. "Radicalism in the Perspective of Islamic-Populism: Trajectory of Political Islam in Indonesia" (2013) 07:02 *J Indones Islam*.
- Kine, Phelim. "Indonesia's growing religious intolerance", *openDemocracy* (25 November 2014), online: <<http://www.opendemocracy.net/openglobalrights/phelim-kine/indonesia%E2%80%99s-growing-religious-intolerance>>.
- . "Indonesia's Growing Religious Intolerance", *Open Democr* (26 November 2014).
- Kurfiss, J G. "Critical Thinking: Theory, Research, Practice, and Possibilities" (1988) 2 ASHE-ERIC High Educ Rep.
- Lim, Merlyna. "Islamic Radicalism and Anti-Americanism in Indonesia: The Role of the Internet" (2005) 18 *Policy Stud* 1.
- . "Many Clicks but Little Sticks: Social Media Activism in Indonesia" (2013) 43:4 *J Contemp Asia* 636.

- Lindsey, Tim. "Monopolising Islam: The Indonesian Ulama Council and state regulation of the 'Islamic economy'" (2012) 48:2 Bull Indones Econ Stud 253.
- Madjid, Nurcholish. "Islam Indonesia Menatap Masa Depan: Aktualisasi Ajaran Ahlussunah Waljamaah" in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusantara Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 118.
- Maton, Karl. "Habitus" in *Pierre Bourdieu Key Concepts* (Durham, 2008).
- Media Indonesia. "Wawasan Kebangsaan Guru PAI Perlu Diperkuat", *Media Indones* (20 December 2016).
- Milla, Mirra Noor, Faturachman & Djamiludin Ancok. "The impact of leader-follower interactions on the radicalization of terrorists: A case study of the Bali bombers" (2013) 16:2 Asian J Soc Psychol 92.
- Movanita, Ambaranie Nadia Kemala. "Ini Daftar Nama Korban Bom Kampung Melayu yang Berhasil Diidentifikasi", *Kompas.com* (25 May 2017).
- Muhadjir, Afifuddin. "Islam Nusantara untuk Peradaban Indonesia dan Dunia" in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusantara Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016).
- Muhammad, Nurdinah. "Karakteristik Jaringan Ulama Nusantara Menurut Pemikiran Azyumardi Azra" (2012) 14:128 J Subst V Ol 1 4 No 1 April 201 2 73.
- Musil, Pelin Ayan. "Democracy and Islam in Indonesia, edited by Mirjam Künkler and Alfred Stepan" (2016) 23:6 Democratization 1092.
- Muzakki, Akh. "The Roots, Strategies, and Popular Perception of Islamic Radicalism in Indonesia" (2014) 08:01 J Indones Islam 1.
- Nailufar, Nibras Nada. "Guru yang Intoleran Membahayakan Siswa (Intolerant Teachers endanger Students)", *Kompas.com* (25 May 2016).
- Nasir, Mohamad Abdun. "The 'Ulamā', Fatāwā and Challenges to Democracy in Contemporary Indonesia" (2014) 25:4 Islam Christ Relat 489.
- Noorhaidi, Hasan. "Salafis Madrasas and Islamic Radicalism in Post-New Order Indonesia" in Kamaruzzaman Bustamam-Ahmad & P Jory, eds, *Islam Stud Islam Educ Contemp Southeast Asia* (Kuala Lumpur, 2011) 93.
- Noraini Hashim, Che & Hasan Langgulung. "Islamic Religious Curriculum in Muslim Countries: The Experiences of Indonesia and Malaysia" (2008) 30:1 Bull Educ Res 1.
- Nuridin, Ahmad Ali. "Islam and State: a Study of the Liberal Islamic Network in Indonesia, 1999-2004" (2005) 7:2 N Z J Asian Stud 20.
- Osman, Mohamed Nawab Mohamed. "Reviving the Caliphate in the Nusantara: Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia's Mobilization Strategy and Its Impact in Indonesia" (2010) 22:4 Terror Polit Violence 601.
- Parker, Lyn. "Teaching Religious Tolerance", *Indones* (4 October 2010).
- . "Religious environmental education? The new school curriculum in Indonesia" (2016) Environ Educ Res 1.
- Pohl, Florian. "Negotiating Religious and National Identities in Contemporary Indonesian Islamic Education" (2011) 61:3 CrossCurrents 399.

- . “The Muhammadiyah: a Muslim Modernist Organization in Contemporary Indonesia” in Michael D Palmer & Stanley M Burgess, eds, *Wiley-Blackwell Companion Relig Soc Justice* (Sussex: John Wiley & Sons, 2012) 243.
- Recuero, Raquel. “Social Media and Symbolic Violence” (2015) 1:1 Soc Media Soc 2056305115580332.
- Reza, Ahmad. “Habib Rizieq Jadi Imam Besar Umat Islam Indonesia, Siapa Kasih Mandat? (Habib Rizieq Casts as The Biggest Leader of Indonesian Muslims, Mandate from Whom?)”, *Seward* (9 January 2017).
- Ritchey, Jeffrey A & Nurhaya Muchtar. “Indonesian Pesantren and Community Social Change: Moderate Islam ’ s Use of Media and Technology for Nonformal , Community-Based Education” (2000) 420.
- Rosidin, Didin Nurul. “PESANTREN AND MODERNITY IN INDONESIA: MA’HAD ALY OF KUNINGAN” (2012) 9:2 HUNAF A J Stud Islam 219.
- Saat, Norshahril. “Kartosuwiryo dan NII: Kajian Ulang Azyumardi” (2014) 21:1 Stud Islam.
- Sakai, Minako & Amelia Fauzia. “Islamic orientations in contemporary Indonesia: Islamism on the rise?” (2014) 15:1 Asian Ethn 41.
- Schubert, J Daniel. “Suffering/Symbolic Violence” in Michael Grenfell, ed, *Pierre Bourdieu Key Concepts* (Durham: Acumen Publishing Limited, 2008).
- Sirozi, Muhammad. “The Intellectual Roots of Islamic Radicalism in Indonesia” (2005) 95 Muslim World 81.
- Smith, Bianca J & Saipul Hamdi. “Between Sufi and Salafi subjects; female leadership, spiritual power and gender matters in Lombok” in Bianca J Smith & Mark Woodward, eds, *Gender Power Indones Islam Lead Fem Sufis Pesantren Selves* (New York: Routledge, 2013) 25.
- Staquf, Yahya C. “Islam Merangkul Nusantara” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 191.
- Suryadarma, Daniel & Gavin W Jones. “Meeting the Education Challenge” in Daniel Suryadarma & Gavin W Jones, eds, *Educ Indones* (Singapore: ISEAS-Yusof Ishak Institute, 2013).
- Temby, Quinton. “Imagining an Islamic State in Indonesia: From Darul Islam to Jemaah Islamiyah” (2010) 89 Indonesia 1.
- Thomson, Patricia. “Field” in *Pierre Bourdieu Key Concepts* (Durham, 2008).
- UNESCO. “Country Report: Indonesia Indonesian Public Policies on Inclusive Education” (2008) 21.
- Wahid, Abdurrahman. “Pribumisasi Islam” in Akhmad Sahal & Munawir Aziz, eds, *Islam Nusant Dari Ushul Fiqh Hingga Paham Kebangs* (Bandung: PT Mizan Media Pustaka, 2016) 33.
- Watson, Jo & Jacqueline Widin. “Maintaining the status quo: symbolic violence in higher education” (2015) 34:3 High Educ Res Dev 658.

- Wood, Elizabeth. "Reconceptualising Child-Centred Education: contemporary directions in policy, theory and practice in early childhood" (2007) 49:1 Forum (Genova) 119.
- Woodward, Mark et al. "The Islamic Defenders Front: Demonization, Violence and the State in Indonesia" (2014) 8:2 Contemp Islam 153.
- Woodward, Mark, Ali Amin & Inayah Rohmaniyah. "Lessons from Aceh Terrorist De-Radicalization" (2010) Ariz Ariz State Univ Consort Strateg Commun.
- Departemen Agama. *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional* (2003).
- Fealy, Greg. "Bigger than Ahok: explaining the 2 December mass rally", (2016), online: *Indones Melb* <<http://indonesiaatmelbourne.unimelb.edu.au/bigger-than-ahok-explaining-jakartas-2-december-mass-rally/>>.
- Gunawan, A. "Indonesia Second Least Literate of 61 Nations", (2016), online: *Jkt Post* <<http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/03/12/indonesia-second-least-literate-61-nations.html>>.
- Ismatullah, Deddy. *Problem dan Tantangan Penerapan Hukum Islam di Indonesia (Problems and Challenges of the Implementation of Islamic Law in Indonesia)* (Jakarta, 2017).
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. "Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Kementerian Agama RI", (2016), online: *Dir Jenderal Pendidik Islam Kementeri Agama RI* <<http://pendis.kemendag.go.id/>>.
- Kurniasih, Imas & Berlin Sani. *Implementasi Kurikulum 2013 Konsep dan Penerapan* (Jakarta, 2014).
- Memory of Majapahit. "Bhineka Tunggal Ika", (2007), online: *Mem Majapahit* <<http://www.eastjava.com/books/majapahit/html/bhinneka.html>>.
- Miller, J W & M C McKenna. "Rank Breakdown", (2016), online: *World Most Lit Nation* <<http://www.ccsu.edu/wmln/rank.html>>.
- Osman, S. "Is Atheism Illegal in Indonesia?", (2012), online: *Jkt Globe* <<http://jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/archive/is-atheism-illegal-in-indonesia/>>.
- Ropi, Ismatu. "Islamic Religious Texts Must be Read in Context to Understand Blasphemy", (2016), online: *Jkt Post* <<http://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2016/12/02/islamic-religious-texts-must-be-read-in-context-to-understand-blasphemy.html>>.
- Sensenig, Victor J. *Indonesia, Islam, and Democracy: Dynamics in a Global Context* (2008).
- SETARA Institute. *Tolerant City Index 2015* (Jakarta, 2015).
- . *Laporan Survei Toleransi Siswa SMA Negeri di Jakarta dan Bandung Raya (Survey Report of High School Students' Tolerance in Jakarta and Greater Bandung)* (Jakarta, 2016).
- Tarsono, Warsa. "Tokoh Penganut Kepercayaan: 'Sudah Matipun Kami Masih Didiskriminasi'", (2015), online: *Madina* <<http://www.madinaonline.id/sosok/wawancara/tokoh-penghayat-kepercayaan-sudah-mati-pun-kami-masih-didiskriminasi/>>.

The Jakarta Post. "Fear of Communism Based on Ignorance, Expert Says", (2016), online: *Jkt Post* <<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CdZFChcZppY>>.

The Jakarta Times. "Aksi Pelarangan Natal di Bandung, Bentuk Pengkhianatan Konstitusional", (2016), online: *Jkt Times*.

Wahid Foundation. "Seperti Apakah Wajah Muslim Indonesia? (How Indonesian Muslims' Face Looklike?)", (2016), online: *Wahid Found* <<https://www.facebook.com/wahidfoundation/videos/1251828724879386/>>.