

Opportunities and Challenges in the Implementation of Collaborative Strategic Reading (CSR) in Teaching Reading Comprehension

Aura Roro Rif'aning Agna^{1*}, Annur Rofiq², Musli Arini³

^{1,2,3}English Language Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, University of Jember, Jember, East Java, Indonesia

* Email: roroaura77@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to discover how CSR (Collaborative Strategic Reading) creates opportunities and challenges for teachers and students in reading comprehension. This study was framed by a case study design. The data were collected using classroom observation and semi-structured interviews with participant consent. The participant of this study was a teacher at Senior High School in Jember. The observation and thematic analysis results revealed that CSR can create opportunities and challenges for teachers and students. The opportunities for CSR for students are boosting comprehension, encouraging student engagement, and increasing knowledge retention. On the other hand, the challenges faced by the teacher are time management, discussion management, and counting on individual learning.

Keywords: CSR; Reading Comprehension; Teaching Strategies

Introduction

There are many strategies that English teachers apply when teaching reading comprehension with the aim that students can gain a deep understanding of a text. One of the strategies that teachers can use in reading comprehension is Collaborative Strategic Reading. In implementing CSR, students will be directed to be active in improving their ability to read and understand a text. The existence of CSR supports developments based on collaborative reading strategies and approaches in elementary and high school environments for language arts, social studies, and science classes that have been demonstrated effectivity in improving understanding of text reading (Boardman et al, 2015). In addition, students also learn to work together in teams to find ideas in a predetermined text (Passig & Maidel-Kravetsky, 2016).

Previous studies have been exploring the effectiveness of collaborative strategy reading in the discipline of science and social studies classes and found that CSR is not so influential for students who are still at the lowest reading level (Boardman et al., 2015). It can be expounded that there are benefits of using CSR by teachers. Research conducted by Babapour, Ahangari, & Ahour, (2019) shows that CSR is superior and influential to students compared to other strategies at the intermediate level at Iran Language Institute. In addition, other studies also found that CSR had significant results for students to understand reading at the high-order thinking or HOT level (Susanti et al, 2020).

Previous studies have only focused on the results of the implementation of CSR and the effectiveness of CSR and do not mention the opportunities and challenges in the implementation of CSR. In addition, the level of students in previous CSR-related research is at the elementary school, junior high school, senior high school, also college student levels. There are differences in the focus of research at each level of education, there are differences in the materials used as research such as texts that used are different learning materials in each previous studies, and the research approach used that is often used in previous studies are quantitative research. Therefore, to show the difference with previous research, the current study focus on the teacher who implement CSR in the classroom. That way EFL teacher can explain their experience about the opportunities and challenges are obtained after implementing CSR in the classroom, especially English classes.

Literature Review

CSR in Teaching Reading Comprehension

Reading comprehension is very complex because reading comprehension is a tool to measure the ability of readers understanding related to various kinds of reading materials (Valdev & Shaari, 2019). Learning activities that students can do daily to improve reading comprehension and writing are learning to read continuous text, pre-reading, and still other reading activities (Wawire & Zuilkowski, 2021). A research conducted by Magableh & Abdullah, (2021) shows that the differences in instructions given by teachers also have an impact on reading comprehension achievement and modifications in implementing instruction can cultivate a soul capable of collaborating in groups and improve the understanding of disciples at a certain level.

Collaborative Strategic Reading is a strategy developed by Janette Klingner and Sharon Vaughn in 1998. CSR is a strategy used in the classroom for students to facilitate reading comprehension in addition to increasing vocabulary and training them in teams (Klingner, Vaughn, & Sullivan, 1998). CSR is a combining strategy of reading comprehension instruction with a group learning model and teachers will provide students with metacognitive knowledge related to reading strategy (Lee, 2017). CSR was developed to encourage students to write, think critically, and be able to self-direct their learning and of course social skills (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021).

In the implementing CSR in the classroom, the first thing the teacher does is introduce the strategies of CSR to all students in the class (Abidin & Riswanto, 2012). This is need to be doing by the teacher because there must be students who do not really understand the steps of CSR (Alqarni, 2015). Based on Klingner and Vaughn 1998, CSR have four steps to facilitate students' ability in reading a text, namely:

1. Preview

In this step, students will recall information that they have known before related to the topic in the text they are reading and they will predict the content of the text. that. Not only that, but this preview also helps teachers to build background knowledge and teach important vocabulary and concepts based on text (Boardman et al., 2015).

2. Click and clunk

This step is carried out when reading, students will observe their abilities by authenticating clunks, or difficult vocabulary, and understanding text concepts. They will do fix-up strategies that will write down in the clunk card. In the fix-up strategies teacher will read aloud a short text and ask students to identify the clunks. The are steps to use fix-up strategies:

- a. Re-read the sentences and look for key ideas to help them understand
- b. Re-read the sentences before and after looking for clues
- c. Look for the prefix, root word, or suffix in the word
- d. Break the word apart and look for the smaller word

3. Get the gist

This step is also done when reading, students will start to compile important ideas and use them as a paragraph or sections. Boardman, *et al* (2015) added

that students will read and stop in each paragraph to find out the most important person, place, or thing.

4. Wrap up

After reading, students summarize what they have learned from a text and identify the most important information from the whole text. In the wrap up there are two activities, namely students answering their questions – questions that they have made related to the text they have read and the second is summarizing important information and presenting it in class (Boardman et al., 2015).

After the student understands the use of these strategies, the teacher will group the students with a maximum of 4 members in each group (Boardman et al., 2015). Furthermore, in the group students will get roles based on steps above and they will work together in the group for students to understand the text given (Lee, 2017). The role used in CSR is the leader who will direct his group members to perform CSR steps and report to the teacher if they find difficulties, clunk expert reminds and receives information related to the problems they face when reading comprehension, gist expert's role is to direct members to get the main idea of a text, reporter is a student who will read the results of the whole idea of a text after discussion based on the CSR learning logs that has been given by the teacher in front of the class (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021). CSR learning log is used to record ideas while implementing each steps, so as to provide a springboard for students to actively participate in their groups (Klingner et al., 1998).

Table 1. CSR Learning Log

Name: _____		Date: _____	
1) a. Brainstorm: What do you already know about this topic?	b. Predict: What do you think you will learn by reading this passage?		
2) Clunks: Please list you clunks			
3) The gist (main idea): Write the gist of the section you read			
4) Make a question: Make a question about main ideas	5) Review: Write something important they learned		

(Klingner et al., 1998)

Implementing CSR Creates Opportunities and Challenges in Reading Class

Students can improve their reading comprehension with the instruction given by the teacher when implementing CSR in the classroom (Novita, 2018). Not only through instruction from the teacher, students can also improve their reading comprehension with the help of their group mates or when in step clunk of CSR (Alqarni, 2015). The students can get the opportunities after the teacher applied CSR in classroom (Mendieta, Muenera, & Olmos, 2015).

The opportunities that students can get as follows: (1) Boosting Comprehension by linking prior knowledge and new knowledge because the preview step requires students to recall information related to the topic and connect it with new information obtained by students (Klingner et al., 1998). This can increase students' interest in a text and learning activities; (2) Encouraging students' engagement by acquire new vocabulary when students read a text and identify difficult vocabulary by doing fix-up strategies, student can tackling vocabulary difficulties (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021); (3) Increasing knowledge retention with student use synthesizes by making questions such as 4W (What, When, Where, Why) and How also make a short summary of a text (Fiorella & Mayer, 2016). Critical thinking by passing all the steps of CSR can train students to be more thorough in reading a text.

CSR can be a challenge for teachers in teaching reading comprehension classes (Klingner & Vaughn, 1998). Some challenges of CSR in reading class as follow: (1) Time management because CSR takes a long time to use because there are four steps and role in the group (Kim, Clapper, Vaughn, Bremer, 2009); (2) Discussion management from noises distraction in the classroom because in CSR the class will be divided into several groups so that when the discussion is going on, the class will become noisier (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021); (3) Counting on individual learning because CSR focus on learner-center and it did not fit and valuable for some student, and it makes not achieve the goal of CSR itself, the teacher need to give direct guidance for every step of CSR so students still on track and can achieve the goal of CSR (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021).

Research Method

This research used a qualitative case study. To collect data, researchers conducted classroom observations and semi-structured interviews with a teacher at a public high school in Jember. Researchers observed how teacher and students performed during the implementation of CSR in teaching reading

comprehension. Then, the researcher interviews by preparing eight questions to ask the teacher to complete the required data. After the data was obtained, the researcher analysed the data using Braun & Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis.

Findings

Observation Result

Observation results show that when CSR is used in the classroom, it raises more challenges than opportunities. The frequency of occurrence of each challenge in CSR is very varied. In total, twenty-three times frequency of challenges appeared in the implementation of CSR in X-E with the division as follows: discussion management appeared eleven times, time management appeared seven times, and counting on individual learning appeared five times. This indicates that the challenge that most often arises when classroom observations is discussion management. However, during the observation process, because some students had little difficulty reading a text, these students had the initiative to copy other group mates, which caused a noise in class. Even though each group had the text, the noise also appeared when one of the students presented. On the other hand, the break time will soon arrive during presentations, so students focus on getting ready for a break rather than paying attention to friends who are presenting.

Second, the frequency of challenges that often appear is time management. Of all the steps in CSR, several take quite a long time, so at the lesson's closing, it is carried out quickly. The CSR step that takes a long time is Clunk. At this step, students can only use fixed-up strategies and may not use Google Translate or a dictionary. The third was the frequency of challenges appearing, counting on individual learning. When Mr. Tian explained the steps of CSR and activities to be carried out by students, some students instead played cell phones and laid their heads on the table; they ignored the teacher's explanation. When the discussion started, it was seen that students who felt they could not carry out their roles in the group tended to be silent and did not try to help their group mates.

Opportunities in implementing CSR appeared eighteen times with the division: Boosting comprehension appeared six times, encouraging students' knowledge appeared six times, and increasing knowledge retention appeared six times. The three opportunities have the exact total because each step of CSR gives rise to different opportunities. Even so, there are steps that bring up two

or three opportunities at once. Similarly, the emergence of opportunities boosts comprehension and encourages students' engagement together in the preview step. This happens because, in the preview step, students were dig up their memories related to a topic and associate them with new knowledge when reading the text. When reading, students immediately can find complex vocabularies they will identify in the next step, namely clunk. That way, students can gain all the opportunities that exist in CSR.

From the researchers' observations, teachers can implement CSR in the classroom to improve student reading comprehension. The problem is that the teacher must control the students when the discussion occurs or the teacher gives more explanations of the CSR instructions. Students also feel interested in using the CSR method because they can get discussion activities differently. In addition, students can hone their previous vocabulary skills and add new vocabulary from the text they read.

The Result of Thematic Analysis

Table 2. Opportunities of Collaborative Strategic Reading

Themes	Coded for	Excerpt
Boosting Comprehension	Making comprehension easier	"...So, they don't need to read too much, then know the meaning until the details are not. Just the predictions of some of these parts correspond to the text, they will know" (Excerpt 1)
	Critical Enhancement	"Students to be able to predict, be able to find difficult words without opening, without finding meaning in dictionaries or using Google Translate." (Excerpt 6)
		"Actively guess the content of the text, find difficult words and when working on LKPD discuss each other." (Excerpt 9)
	Improve students' understanding	"This method is quite interesting to apply to improve students' understanding of reading" (Excerpt 18)
		"In addition to guessing earlier, then

		what else, clunk, then the last one writes the whole review, that is one, making questions too, that is one form of what is, one part that makes the children understand the content of the text. So indeed, when they make questions from the given reading they also, help them to understand the content of the text, like that."
Increasing Knowledge Retention	Students' understanding can long-lasting	"That makes it easier for children to recall their memories. So, it's good for the long term" (Excerpt 4)
		"But they will not forget 100%, there will definitely be their memories stuck in their brains" (Excerpt 5)
		"Can increase students' understanding in a rather long period of time." (Excerpt 2)
Encouraging Students' Engagement	Teacher goes around accompanying the students	"Then we have to go around to make sure the first is the student knows his instructions, the student / group knows what to do." (Excerpt 10)
		"So, the teacher when there is a group discussion is obliged to accompany students in each group." (Excerpt 11)
	Encourage student's understanding of the text	"But they can guess, they can predict the meaning. So, I think it is very good for students if they know the meaning by themselves by predicting. I think it is good for students to encourage the students understanding of reading" (Excerpt 7).
	Teacher motivates students to engage in discussion	"So what, so as to feel involved in the discussion. That's what I do, I don't let go, we don't let them discuss themselves, we don't let them do anything, we want one to sleep, two to

		sleep, one to do, no" (Excerpt 12).
		"Even if they don't understand, we help them to help discuss with other friends" (Excerpt 14)
		"Providing support to children, confidence to children that they can do it without using google translate, without what it is called, without opening a dictionary, they can do it. So that things that provide motivation, talking to children, going around, this is one of my ways to make children not bored" (Excerpt 20).
		"But we encourage children who are relaxed, look relaxed, seem to play no role in the discussion" (Excerpt 13)

Table 3. Challenges of Collaborative Reading Strategies

Themes	Coded for	Excerpt
Time Management	Students' take a long time	"Moving (moving students from the previous student seat to the new seat (with groups)) requires a considerable time" (Excerpt 16).
		"Maybe, what consumes time is that usually students are used to using google translate to translate, well because yesterday they shouldn't, they tried to guess about the content of the text, what topic, so it took quite a long time" (Excerpt 23).
	Managing time	"Ensure that they are in the correct group in a short period of time" (Excerpt 17).
		"Eeee..... It depends on the text. Incidentally, the text used yesterday was descriptive text"

		(Excerpt 22).
	Students lacking of vocabularies	“Yes, yes that's a bit difficult. Because they are related to vocabularies. Because not all children have vocabularies, right, some are lacking. When looking for vocab is difficult, looking for its meaning is a bit difficult indeed” (Excerpt 24).
Discussion Management	Students are not conducive	“Nothing, just one factor, not the difficulty of some kind of problem faced when implementing a learning method based on discussion methods, then the first is to condition students a little heavy” (Excerpt 15)
	Establish a comfortable atmosphere	“The main thing is that we must build a comfortable environment in the classroom” (Excerpt 7).
Counting on Individual learning	Students' do not pay attention	“In the group, there will be children whose terms are relaxed, children who play alone, children who do not pay attention to their friends in groups” (Excerpt 19)

Boosting Comprehension

Boosting comprehension is an activity in which students link their prior knowledge and new knowledge related to the topic they discuss in class. Then, the students will recall the information they have known before related to the topic and connect with the new information they obtained. The teacher that I interviewed said:

“...because, in CSR before reading they start predicting what the reading is about, what it is about, what paragraph 1 is talking about, what paragraph 2 is talking about. It is to help children understand the text.” (Excerpt 1)

The teacher will guide students to predict a reading, they guess about the text. It can attract students to read a text and easily understand it. Students will more easily improve their reading comprehension. The teacher agreed to this by revealing:

“This method is quite interesting to apply to improve students’ understanding of reading” (Excerpt 18)

When students reach the clunk stage, which is finding difficult vocabulary and finding the meaning of difficult vocabulary using fix-up strategies, it can also increase their critical enhancement. The teacher stated, as follows:

“Students and their groups are active in guessing the content of the text, finding difficult words and when working on LKPD they discuss with each other.” (Excerpt 9)

The statements above prove that boosting comprehension is one of the opportunities to get from CSR. All stages of CSR can improve students' reading comprehension by making it easier for students to understand text and think critically.

Encouraging Students’ Engagement

When students start reading the contents of the reading, and they do not know some vocabulary, they are directed to use fixed-up strategies in CSR. Using these fix-up strategies, students will guess what is meant by sentences containing complex vocabulary and predict the meaning of the difficult vocabulary. Students will feel compelled to understand a passage when they can find the meaning of complex vocabulary. The opinion of the teacher supports this, that is:

“But they can be guests, they can predict the meaning. So, I think it’s very good for students if they know what it means themselves by predicting. I think it’s good for students to encourage students to understand reading.” (Excerpt 7)

From predicting activities using fixed-up strategies, students will need help independently finding the meaning of the difficult vocabulary. They will stick more to their memories regarding the vocabulary they find. The teacher expected this, and then he said:

“With CSR we expect students to be able to predict, be able to find difficult words and finding the meaning without open the dictionaries or using Google Translate.” (Excerpt 6)

Therefore, predicting the meaning of difficult vocabulary can make students get the opportunities of CRS namely encourage students' engagement.

Increasing Knowledge Retention

All steps in CSR start with those who link their previous knowledge with new knowledge, identify difficult vocabulary, find the main idea of a text, write down the essential things in the text, and then present their work. All these things can increase their knowledge retention. The teacher supports this by saying:

*"So, in the future when we ask about a place, they will recall that in paragraph 1 there is anything, oh there is a location, there is a size, there is a height, and so on. Then, when we ask paragraph 2 what is there, "oh sir, in the second paragraph if I am not mistaken there are floors, stupas, there are Buddha statues, and so on. **That makes it easier for children to recall their memories. So, it is good for the long term"** (Excerpt 4)*

When it comes to memory, every student has a different memory. It could be related to information they get from the internet or things related to daily life—likewise, memory in absorbing learning material. By implementing CSR when learning English, it will be easier for them to remember the material delivered by the teacher over a long period. The teacher conveyed this, that is:

*"Then when we say, what Borobudur Temple is about, what paragraph 1 is talking about, "Oh, location, yes, sir." So, try recalling. **But they will not forget 100%, there will be their memories stuck in their brains"** (Excerpt 5)*

In this way, implementing CSR in reading comprehension learning can provide opportunities for students. So, students can still remember some of the learning material they have received for a long time.

Time Management

The teacher was teaching English in class for two hours or 2x45 minutes. During this time, the teacher must be able to convey all the material that the teacher has determined before class begins to achieve maximum learning outcomes. Thus, the teacher must be good at managing the time when delivering material or when asking students to work on questions given by the teacher. Especially when using learning methods such as CSR, which require

students to work in groups, it will take quite a long time for students to gather in groups determined by the teacher. The teacher argues as follows:

*".....when implementing a learning method based on discussion methods, then the first is to condition students a little heavy, **moving (moving students from the previous student seat to the new seat (with groups)) requires a considerable time.**" (Excerpt 16)*

In addition to the movement of students in forming groups. The thing that takes quite a long time is step clunk. In this step, students are required to find the meaning of vocabularies using fix-up strategies, not using google translate or dictionary. So, students who do not have a lot of vocabulary will have a hard time. This is in line with what the teacher said, namely:

*"Maybe, what consumes time is that usually students are used to using google translate to translate, well because yesterday they **shouldn't**, they tried to guess about the content of the text, what topic, so it took quite a long time."* (Excerpt 23)

This happens because students do not have much vocabulary. So, when implementing CSR, students can't quickly find difficult vocabulary. However, it cannot find the meaning of such difficult vocabulary using fix-up strategies. This is in line with what Mr. Tian said, that is:

*"Yes, yes that's a bit difficult. Because they are related to vocabularies. **Because not all children have vocabularies, right, some are lacking. When looking for vocab is difficult, looking for its meaning is a bit difficult indeed**"* (Excerpt 24)

Teacher already knows and understands about the condition of the students in the class. He tries to makes the students to gather with their respective groups immediately. So, learning can continue and can be finished on time. This was stated by the teacher, namely:

*"But as teachers we must control the children so that they immediately group according to their respective groups. **Ensure that they are in the correct group in a short period of time.**"* (Excerpt 17)

Ensuring students gather in groups in a short time is one alternative solution that teachers can do when controlling students after dividing classes into several groups.

Discussion Management

During the learning process in the classroom, distractions will arise, either from outside the classroom or inside the classroom. Also, the case in implementing CSR, especially since CSR is a method that requires students to work in groups, makes it difficult to condition the class to be calm and pay attention to the instructions given by the teacher. It was also expressed by the teacher, that is:

“Nothing, just one factor, not the difficulty of some kind of problem faced when implementing a learning method based on discussion methods, then the first is to condition students a little heavy.”
(Excerpt 15)

To ensure effective learning, teachers must cultivate a calm behavior in their students and ensure they can follow instructions. Creating a comfortable learning environment is one approach to achieving this goal, as it helps students focus on the teacher’s instructions without being distracted by external or classroom disruptions.

Counting on Individual Learning

In learning that focuses more on students and uses group discussions, some students feel they need more support and choose to study independently. These students will withdraw more from the group and not want to participate in the group. Students need to pay more attention to learning and choose to relax or play on their cell phones. The teacher was said:

“In the group, there will be children whose terms are relaxed, children who play alone, children who do not pay attention to their friends in groups” (Excerpt 19)

Even though some students seem to be relaxing and not paying attention, he does not just keep quiet as a teacher. As a teacher, it is mandatory to motivate students so that students are moved to participate in group discussions so that each student can achieve goals from learning, especially learning that uses this CSR.

Discussion

In this discussion part the researcher discussed the results of opportunities and challenges in the implementation of CSR in teaching reading

comprehension. In this discussion section, I discuss the crucial aspects about my findings. The first discussion is about the opportunities of CSR in teaching reading comprehension.

In implementing CSR, various opportunities related to student reading comprehension arise. Recall information activities that students know before with new information, as in the step preview in CSR. The teacher said that by making predictions of the text in the preview step, students can more easily understand the content of the text. When classroom observation, students show that activities in step preview can boost their comprehension. The study found that linking prior knowledge with new knowledge can boost students' reading comprehension (Klingner et al., 1998). Students can acquire new vocabulary when searching for clunks where students predict the meaning of difficult vocabulary without opening a dictionary. This is in line with a previous study in which when students read a text and identify difficult vocabulary by using fix-up strategies, they can easily understand difficult vocabulary (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021). The teacher also stated student can have long terms memories about their reading materials after applied CSR in classroom. The study found that student activities make 5W + 1H questions, and a text summary can increase students' knowledge retention (Fiorella & Mayer, 2016). So, the finding found that CSR can creates the opportunities for students in reading comprehension.

The Second is about the challenges of CSR in teaching reading comprehension. Teachers face challenges when implementing CSR in reading comprehension. Teachers faced difficulties implementing CSR because the steps of CSR take a long time. For example, when the teacher forms students in groups and conditions students to immediately gather with their respective groups. In addition, in Step Clunk, students take a long time to find the meaning of vocabulary, which is difficult because they do not use dictionaries. This is evidenced by classroom observation that is slightly hampered in step clunk because students have difficulty finding the meaning of vocabulary. The previous study also stated that all steps of CSR, namely preview, clunk, get the gist, and final, take a long time (Klingner et al., 1998).

Another challenge faced by teacher is when the discussion process by students runs. During the student's discussion, the teacher finds it difficult to discipline the students to pay attention to every instruction the teacher gives. The study found that when students are discussion after divided into several groups, they make noisy atmosphere and distracts another student from the

ongoing discussion process (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021). In the classroom observation found that many students discuss in a loud enough voice or even go around to other groups to cheat answers. The findings found that students played alone and did not pay attention to instructions or groups. Previous research stated that student-centered learning, such as CSR, is unsuitable for some students and results in not achieving the goals of CSR itself (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021). The findings found that students played alone and did not pay attention to instructions or groups.

Each method will have challenges that teachers will face in applying the method. However, teacher also have various solutions to overcome the challenges in CSR. If some students are weak and irresponsible with their tasks in one group, one or several other students will feel unable to carry out activities and interactions effectively (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021). In the current study, when teachers look into each group that has been formed, teachers try to motivate weak students to participate in groups. The teacher's direction and motivation will increase students' confidence to complete their tasks. Teachers provide feedback as a form of support for students when they struggle with the steps of CSR (Amjadi & Talebi, 2021).

The impact on reading comprehension students can be seen based on the opportunities and challenges found in CSR. Therefore, teachers must pay more attention and be able to overcome the challenges faced when implementing CSR. However, this study only focuses on teachers, opportunities, challenges, and how the teacher overcomes the challenges faced during the implementation of CSR. It does not focus on how students deal with opportunities and challenges while implementing CSR.

Conclusion

Based on research findings and discussion in the previous chapter, CSR can create opportunities for students who need to improve their reading comprehension. On the other hand, when teacher implement CSR in reading class, there will be challenges faced by teachers, both external and internal. In addition, teachers also try to overcome the challenges received during the implementation of the CSR process and try to solve these problems aimed at creating comfortable learning so students can receive learning well.

References

- Abidin, M., & Riswanto, R. (2012). Collaborative Strategic Reading (CSR) within Cognitive and Metacognitive Strategies perspectives. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 4(1), 61–70. <http://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/EJBM/article/view/1027>
- Alqarni, F. (2015). Collaborative Strategic Reading to Enhance Learners' Reading Comprehension in English as a Foreign Language. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, 4(1), 161–166. <https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2015.v4n1p161>
- Amjadi, A., & Talebi, S. H. (2021). Extending the efficacy of Collaborative Strategic Reading (CSR) in teaching reading strategies: A socio-cultural emotional perspective. In *Language Teaching Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/13621688211011501>
- Babapour, M., Ahangari, S., & Ahour, T. (2019). The effect of shadow reading and collaborative strategic reading on EFL learners' reading comprehension across two proficiency levels. *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, 13(4), 318–330. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17501229.2018.1465059>
- Bermillo, J. E., & Merto, V. L. T. (2022). Collaborative Strategic Reading on Students' Comprehension and Motivation. *European Journal of English Language Teaching*, 7(1), 71–103. <https://doi.org/10.46827/ejel.v7i1.4148>
- Beucher, B., Arya, D., & Wang, C. (2020). Interactive whiteboard (IWB) use during student collaborative reading practices: A year-long comparison of instructional approaches. *Education 3-13*, 48(7), 779–794. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2019.1649292>
- Boardman, A. G., Klingner, J. K., Buckley, P., Annamma, S., & Lasser, C. J. (2015). The efficacy of Collaborative Strategic Reading in middle school science and social studies classes. *Reading and Writing*, 28(9), 1257–1283. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11145-015-9570-3>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Qualitative Research in Psychology Using thematic analysis in psychology Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. <http://www.tandfonline.com/action/journalInformation?journalCode=uqrp20>
<http://www.tandfonline.com/action/journalInformation?journalCode=uqrp20>
- Creswell, J. W. (2006). *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research* (Fourth Ed). Pearson.
- Fiorella, L., & Mayer, R. E. (2016). Eight Ways to Promote Generative Learning. *Educational Psychology Review*, 28(4), 717–741. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-015-9348-9>

- Kim, Ae-Hwa; Clapper, Ann T; Vaughn, Sharon; Bremer, C. (2009). Research to Practice Brief. *Cdl.Secured-Ecommerce.Net*, 1(March), 1–12. <http://www.cdl.secured-ecommerce.net/resource-library/pdf/NeverTooLate.pdf>
- Kim, H., Sefcik, J. S., & Bradway, C. (2017). Characteristics of Qualitative Descriptive Studies: A Systematic Review. *Research in Nursing and Health*, 40(1), 23–42. <https://doi.org/10.1002/nur.21768>
- Klingner, J. K., & Vaughn, S. (1998). Using Collaborative Strategic Reading. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 32–37.
- Klingner, J. K., Vaughn, S., & Sullivan, L. (1998). *Using orative Strategic Reading*. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/004005999803000607>
- Lee, K. (2017). Using Collaborative Strategic Reading with Refugee English Language Learners in an Academic Bridging Program. *TESL Canada Journal*, 33(10), 97–108. <https://doi.org/10.18806/tesl.v33i0.1248>
- Magableh, I. S. I., & Abdullah, A. (2021). The Impact of Differentiated Instruction on Students' Reading Comprehension Attainment in Mixed-Ability Classrooms. *Interchange*, 52(2), 255–272. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10780-021-09427-3>
- Mendieta, J., Múnera, L., Olmos, T., Onatra, C., Pérez, P., & Rojas, E. (2015). Fostering reading comprehension and self-directed learning in a collaborative strategic reading (CSR) setting. *Ikala*, 20(1), 15–42. <https://doi.org/10.17533/udea.ikala.v20n1a02>
- Novita, D. (2018). *Collaborative Strategic Reading (CSR): An Attractive Strategy for Teaching Reading Skill*. 125(Icigr 2017), 98–102. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icigr-17.2018.24>
- Passig, D., & Maidel-Kravetsky, J. (2016). The impact of collaborative online reading on summarizing skills. *Education and Information Technologies*, 21(3), 531–543. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-014-9337-5>
- Sağirli, M. (2020). Comparison of reading comprehension levels of literate learners with different methods. *Education 3-13*, 48(1), 100–117. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2019.1593481>
- Susanti, A., Retnaningdyah, P., Ayu, A. N. P., & Trisusana, A. (2020). Improving EFL Students' Higher Order Thinking Skills Through Collaborative Strategic Reading in Indonesia. *International Journal of Asian Education*, 1(2), 43–52. <https://doi.org/10.46966/ijae.v1i2.37>
- Valdev Singh, R. K., & Shaari, A. H. (2019). The analysis of Higher-Order Thinking skills in English reading comprehension tests in Malaysia. *Malaysian Journal of Society and Space*, 15(01), 12–26. <https://doi.org/10.17576/geo-2019-1501-02>

Wawire, B. A., & Zuilkowski, S. S. (2021). The role of vocabulary and decoding language skills in reading comprehension: a cross-linguistic perspective. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 15(1), 23–42.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/19313152.2020.1753953>